

GCSE

Ancient History

General Certificate of Secondary Education

Unit A032: The Rise of Rome

Mark Scheme for June 2013

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, Cambridge Nationals, Cambridge Technicals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.

All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

OCR will not enter into any discussion or correspondence in connection with this mark scheme.

© OCR 2013

1. Annotations

Annotation	Meaning
AL	Evidence for making a judgement on the quality of AO1 (Recall, Select and Organise) performance in Section B.
AZ	Evidence for making a judgement on the quality of AO2 (Understanding) performance in Section B.
A	Evidence for making a judgement on the quality of AO3 (Interpret, Evaluate, Respond) performance in Section B.
[444]	Indication of where the examiner has given 'Benefit of Doubt' to part of an answer either due to lack of clarity of potential confusion in Section B
<u> </u>	Indication that an examiner has seen and given due credit for additional material on a separate page or where it is out of sequence in both Sections A and B.

2. Subject-specific Marking Instructions

Marking grids should be used throughout. Where 5 has been allocated, examiners should look to award 5 marks if there is not a good reason to go to the bottom of the level.

Option 1 :The origins of Rome: The kings, 753–508 BC

Q	uestic	n Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
		Indicative content			Levels of response
1		 AO1: Factual details: established laws, justice and religious customs temple of Janus friendships with surrounding peoples divided the year into twelve months changes to the priesthood chose the Vestal Virgins created respect for/ fear of the Gods creation of the pomerium 	5	Outline two important developments in Rome during the reign of Numa. Two discrete developments with detail from Numa's reign needed – some examples provided but other viable answers possible	AO1 = 5 Level 5 5 Level 4 3-4 Level 3 2 Level 1/2 0-1
2	(a)	 AO1: Factual details: basket containing the baby twins – Romulus and Remus – left at the river shore found by a 'she-wolf' who suckled them/ nurtured them role of shepherd Faustulus role of his wife Laurentia 	4	Outline what Passage 1A tells us about how Romulus and Remus were brought up. Answers here need to be drawn from the Livy passage: possible responses could be those provided – candidates do not have to mention all to gain full marks.	AO2 = 4 Level 5

Question	Answer	Marks	Guida	Guidance	
	Indicative content			Levels of response	
(b)	 AO2: Understanding Romulus and Remus survived which allowed Rome to be founded by Romulus the upbringing was unusual/ unconventional reward any plausible discussion which links the twins' upbringing to the foundation of Rome the style/methods of this unusual upbringing had a number of connotations/associations: the twins were sons of Mars according to legend – military and warlike connotations discovery by the 'she-wolf' builds on this wild, dangerous image brought up by the shepherd and his wife – reinforced the simple, humble upbringing: lack of pretension/ artifice. 	4	Using the details from Passage 1A, explain the importance of Romulus' and Remus' upbringing for the Romans. Reward highly any discussion where these aspects are linked into an understanding of the origins of Rome and the qualities/ values with which later Romans wanted to be associated. Need for understanding of context here: possible answers could be those provided – candidates do not have to mention all to get full marks.	AO2 = 4 Level 5	

Question	Answer	Marks Guidar		nce	
	Indicative content			Levels of response	
(c)	 AO3: Evaluation and interpretation of the source for the higher bands answers must focus on this passage and consider how Livy could have known the details contained in it analysis of details from this passage and how probable these were general discussion of the value of Livy should be rewarded – the fact the stories of early Roman history come from Greek myths (ie borrowing these Greek foundation myths) there may be reference to Livy's possible sources – Fabius Pictor, Piso, Macer – and archaeological evidence: reward highly if accurate and relevant. 	5	In your opinion, how accurate is Livy's account of the events in Passage 1A? Need for evaluation of the passage here: discussion of the value of Livy as a source is needed what does Livy say and how accurate is it likely to be.	AO3 = 5 Level 5	

Q	uestion	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
		Indicative content			Levels of response
3	(a)	 AO1: Factual details Factual details about the Consualia taken from the Livy passage: the different tribes that had been invited: Caeninsenses, Sabines, Crustimini, Antemnates and that 'all the nearest communities were there' the Sabines initially invited into Roman homes and treated well indication that the Sabines were impressed by the development that Rome had undergone Roman trickery: a planned riot – the unmarried Sabine women were seized with the most beautiful being carried off to the most important men by lower class men. Reward any reference to relevant details beyond the passage that might help to explain context (eg earlier in Livy 1.9 which describes the rejection of ambassadors sent by Romulus to the neighbouring communities to 'see if people would make friendships and marry into the new community') – shows fear of these neighbouring communities of the power of Rome and the fact that the relationship is not good? 	14	In what ways does Passage 1B help us to understand the relationship between the Romans and the communities nearest them? Need for factual details about the Consualia taken from the Livy passage – a number of possible details are suggested but reward other relevant and justifiable details.	AO1 = 4 Level 5
		 AO2: Understanding understanding of the situation that Rome is in and reasons why Romulus set up the Consualia – lack of women 		Need for understanding of context here: possible answers that students could explore are	AO2 = 5 Level 5 5 Level 4 3-4 Level 3 2

Question	Answer	Marks	Guida	ince	
	Indicative content			Levels of response	
	 the Sabines were 'amazed how quickly the Roman development had grown' could suggest: lack of frequent contact before this event fear of Roman progress 'all the nearest communities' being there might suggest trust from these neighbouring tribes at the invitation and previous to the events described here Romans prepared to resolve development issues and break trust with neighbouring tribe by plan of seizing unmarried Sabine women. 		suggested – do not need all for full marks. Answers should be able to link the detail with some discussion of what light is thrown on the relationship between the Romans and their neighbours.	Level 1/2 0-1	
	 AO3: Interpretation, evaluation and response understanding of when Livy was writing (seven centuries later) and how this may have affected what he wrote details of how the Romans were relating to their neighbours and how this is being presented linking in with AO2, credit highly responses that present some discussion of Livy's aims in presenting this episode of Roman history in this particular way – framing the history of early Rome in a manner which would be perceived as positive in Livy's own time. 		Evaluation of Livy as a source – the passage is quite detailed: expect some discussion as to how would Livy have known about these details. What sources would Livy have consulted or just accepted in writing his history.	AO3 = 5 Level 5	

Question	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
	Indicative content			Levels of response
(b)	 AO1: Factual details expect/reward further details from Livy 1.9–13: after the event Romulus offered various benefits to the abducted women (marriage/ children/citizenship) successful Roman war against the Caeninenses/ Crustimini/Antemnates and eventually the Sabines: perhaps some details of these with reference to the Sabine leadership (Titus Tatius/ Mettius Curtius) the ending of the war and agreements between the Romans and the Sabines: Quirites and the 'fusion' of the two peoples there may be some reference to/comparison with Plutarch (Romulus, 14–21): do not expect to see this but if so reward fully. 	18	How useful is Livy in helping us to understand why the Sabines were important in the early development of Rome? Livy is the key ancient source here – some useful areas to look for and reward are suggested. There may be reference to other sources – eg Plutarch.	AO1 = 5 Level 5
	 this method was a way in which the Romans were able to break out of the restrictions on Rome's development: gain the means to ensure Rome's continuing population growth a means of merging with and assimilating local tribes through relatively peaceful means 		Need to see some definition and some attempt to explain/make a judgement on what is meant by importance – ie how relationship and eventual fusion of the two peoples under Romulus laid the foundation for the onward development of Rome as a city state and perhaps regional power.	AO2 = 5 Level 5

Question	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
	Indicative content			Levels of response
	 consolidates the reputation of Romulus as a wise and successful leader who provided a firm basis for Rome's future. 			
	 AO3: Interpretation, Evaluation and Response understanding of when Livy was writing (seven centuries later) and how this may have affected what he wrote – ie the context of the Augustan age and trying to present this as a return to the 'heroic age' of Rome's early years reward reference to and discussion of Livy's Preface in an attempt to understand his motives in writing and presenting Roman history in this way: 'what sort of lives and morals the people had, and the men and their skills which they used at home and in wars to win power and extend it' 		Detailed evaluation of Livy (unlikely to be dealing with other sources): there is considerable amount of detail here which is useful and helps build a considerable picture. Need to assess the accuracy of Livy's account – some overlap with AO3 for question 3a) here.	AO3 = 8 Level 5 7-8 Level 4 5-6 Level 3 3-4 Level 1/2 0-2

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance		
	Indicative content			Levels of response	
4	AO1: Factual details about the origins of the Romans before Romulus the story of Aeneas – key aspects of this according to Livy (Livy, 1.3) and the link to Rome: • Aeneas, son of Anchises and Venus left Troy and after many travels arrived in Laurentum • Aeneas married Lavinia daughter of King Latinus and founded city of Lavinium • Aeneas' son, Ascanius, born • but war against Turnus (Rutulians) and the Etruscans: 'Latins' won but Aeneas killed • Differing accounts about Ascanius/Iulus, founder of Alba Longa • the kings of Alba (Sivius to Amulius) and the rape of Rhea Silva leading to the birth of 'the twins' and eventual foundation of Rome. the story of Aeneas – key aspects of the story according to Virgil (Virgil 1.1–11) and also (6.752–772): • 'Savage Juno' forces Aeneas' exile from Troy with his father Anchises and son Ascanius (wife/mother Creusa died) • Founded his city in, and bought his gods, to Latium • links to Alba and then through to Rome's foundation.	30	'The ancient sources give us an accurate history of the origins of the Romans before Romulus.' How far do you agree with this view? Candidates will need to address 'origins of the Romans' in their answers – some points are suggested but reward other relevant and justifiable details.	AO1 = 10 Level 5	

Qı	uestion	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
		Indicative content			Levels of response
		the story of Evander and Hercules – key aspects of this story according to Livy (Livy 1.7): • Hercules/ Geryon/ Cacus • role of Evander (Greek) and the creation of the Hercules cult • role of Potitii and Pinarii in continuing the cult • the cult was later adopted by Romulus Factual information indicating the context and time when Virgil and Livy were writing. AO2: Understanding • candidates need to explore the issue of whether it is possible to have accurate information about the origins of the Romans before Romulus • evidently the information in both Livy and Virgil is myth but expect some discussion of the significance of this: • Aeneas' ancestry and the importance of the links with Troy: realisation that Virgil and Livy, respectively, emphasise the divine ancestry and the heroic past to elevate Rome's foundation • Evander and the Greek context responsible for bringing Greek learning/ culture/ pantheon to Italy (Evander's mother Carmenta who		Need for explanation and judgement that is relevant to the question — analysis of the role of myth in (and links to) the foundation of Rome. Do not expect detailed discussion of the significance of myth but reward highly understanding of this.	AO2 = 10 Level 5 8-10 Level 4 6-7 Level 3 4-5 Level 2 2-3 Level 1 0-1

Q	uestion	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
		Indicative content			Levels of response
		'was believed to be divine'), thus links with Hercules myth/ Greek mythology Ilinks with other foundation myths of Rome: belief that Evander established the Lupercalia (ie Romulus/ Remus myth) credit highly responses that recognise early Roman 'society' very much developing out of Greek culture/ city-states established in Italy. A03: Interpretation, Evaluation and Response Virgil: commissioned to write the Aeneid during 20s BC in order to link Augustus and Julian clan to Romulus and foundation of Rome; thus will present the story of Rome's origins in a specific way. Also need to assess the value of poetry as historical evidence Livy: although not directly commissioned would most likely wish to present Rome's legendary past in its best light for several reasons (personal preferences – see Preface – but also to support the Augustan regime which had restored order after the chaos of the civil wars).		Need to evaluate Livy and Virgil as sources here – the sources that Livy may have had access to, the reasons for and context within which he is writing.	AO3 = 10 Level 5 8-10 Level 4 6-7 Level 3 4-5 Level 2 2-3 Level 1 0-1

Q	uestion	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
		Indicative content			Levels of response
		SPaG Spelling, punctuation and grammar are assessed using the SPaG grid at the end of this mark scheme.	6		High performance 5–6 Intermediate performance 3–4 Threshold performance 1–2

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance	
	Indicative content			Levels of response
5	AO1: Factual details Explicit and sustained reference to the chosen king and at least one other – some of the following themes/content could be discussed: • Romulus: Livy 1, 8 and 9–15; also Virgil 6,778-787 • legal/ political aspects (laws/ lictors/ senators/ building of the city of Rome) • foreign policy/ strategic aspects (war with Sabines/ Veii et al) • Numa: Livy 1, 18–20: also Virgil 6, 811-12 • religious/legal/political aspects (religious buildings – Temple of Janus and altar for Jove/calendar/priesthoods/Vestal Virgins) • foreign policy (peace with the surrounding peoples) • Tullus: Livy 1, 22/23 onwards; also Virgil 6, 813–15 • foreign policy (war against the Albans and later the Sabines • Ancus: Livy 1, 32–34; also Virgil 6, 816–19 • religious and foreign policy aspects • Tarquins: 'good' things in political/ social/ foreign policy aspects: • Priscus increased the size of the	30	With reference to the ancient sources, explain which of the kings you think was the most successful ruler of Rome. Key aspects (ie policies and actions) of the reigns of the chosen kings according to Livy (and Virgil) with relevant details – some of the key themes are suggested and students would be expected to cover most – but not all – of these themes for their chosen king and comparison with at least one other for highest marks. Reward any reference to nonliterary evidence (ie archaeological evidence). Exceptionally there may be references to Plutarch (lives of Romulus and Numa): do not expect to see this but if there are references, reward fully.	AO1 = 10 Level 5 8-10 Level 4 6-7 Level 3 4-5 Level 2 2-3 Level 1 0-1

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidanc	Guidance	
	Indicative content			Levels of response	
	Senate (Livy 1, 35), successful war against the Sabines and 'ancient Latins' (Livy 1, 36–8), construction projects (Livy 1.38: drainage/planning – Circus Maximus/fortification/forum/temple of Jupiter) • Superbus' success in foreign policy (Volscii/ Gabii/ Aequii), attributed construction (cloaca maxima/ circus maximus/ the forum – Livy 1.56) the Tarquins also responsible for some poor actions/policies: • legal abuse: Superbus 'trying of capital causes without consultation' and refusal to consult the Senate (Livy 1, 49) • Priscus' 'trickery' of removing Ancus' sons, arrogance (Livy,1.36): manner in which Servius was killed and Priscus took power (Livy 1,48/9) • Superbus 'lawless and tyrannical' (Livy 1.52)/ 'leading citizens killed' (Livy 1.56) • Sextus' rape of Lucretia (Livy 1.58), 'robbery and violence' amongst the Gabii (Livy 1.59) relevant sections of Livy and Virgil (as above but reward other accurate references) and details of when Livy and Virgil were writing.				

Question	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
	Indicative content			Levels of response
	 AO2: Understanding Explanation and some judgement in answer to the question: using information from AO1, candidates need to make the case why their chosen king has the qualities/ actions/ policies that make him successful also using information from AO1, candidates need to make a comparison with at least one other king explaining why the chosen king was more successful whilst the compared example was less successful understanding/ awareness of the influences that shaped the life and writing of both Livy and Virgil. 		Answers must use the information from AO1 to present an explanation and make a judgement within the context of the question – the rubric guidance gives very clear indication as to the need for a comparison between at least two individuals. Candidates will need to explore a comparison to access higher mark levels – focus on one king will only allow access to top of level 3 at best	AO2 = 10 Level 5 8-10 Level 4 6-7 Level 3 4-5 Level 2 2-3 Level 1 0-1
	 AO3: Interpretation, Evaluation and Response despite attempting a historical explanation of the Kings, Livy's views would have been shaped by the events of his own times: linking with AO2, candidates will need to analyse the reliability and aims of Livy – reward fully any discussion of/reference to Livy's Preface and focus on moral issues as a reason for decline of the Kings (and influence of the moral recovery attempted by Augustus) in evaluating Livy as evidence, credit highly responses that make some assessment of Livy's own sources and 		Answers should discuss the aims of Livy and Virgil in presenting the Kings in these particular ways and the accuracy and reliability of both as evidence here: reward any reference to other forms of evidence – most likely to be archaeological – but this is not necessary for students to reach highest mark levels. Expect a fuller focus on Livy – Virgil references are (and will be limited): however, the question is specific on	AO3 = 10 Level 5 8-10 Level 4 6-7 Level 3 4-5 Level 2 2-3 Level 1 0-1

Question	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
	Indicative content			Levels of response
	 a judgement as to accuracy of what he was writing. Credit highly any illustration of argument with reference to archaeological evidence – links to AO1: the Temple of Jupiter, Cloaca Maxima – as Livy attempts to put these into an historical context any evaluation of Virgil must take into account the reasons/ aims/ context in writing the Aeneid and the presentation of the Kings in this particular idealised way: also the nature of poetry as historical evidence. 		ancient sources so to access highest mark levels responses must deal with more than just Livy.	
	SPaG Spelling, punctuation and grammar are assessed using the SPaG grid at the end of this mark scheme.	6		High performance 5–6 Intermediate performance 3–4 Threshold performance 1–2

Option 2: Hannibal's invasion and defeat, 218–146 BC

Q	uestion	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
		Indicative content			Levels of response
6		 AO1: Factual details delaying tactics which centred on: avoiding a pitched battle kept his army on the higher ground stayed away from Hannibal's cavalry and always at a distance from the Carthaginian army to use Rome's financial strength to counter Hannibal's limited resources to use Italy's greater manpower to decrease Hannibal's smaller army 	5	Outline two tactics used by Quintus Fabius Maximus against Hannibal. Two aspects needed – some examples provided but other viable answers possible.	AO1 = 5 Level 5 5 Level 4 3-4 Level 3 2 Level 1/2 0-1
7	(a)	 AO1: Factual details the length and dangers of the journey from New Spain: 5 months enemy action river-crossings savage terrain need to build paths loss of soldiers/men 'had been very serious' 'even more severe loss' of pack animals/horses and impact on elephants to 'a sorry state'. 	4	Using Passage 2A, outline the difficulties the Carthaginians faced on this part of their journey. Answers here need to be drawn from the Polybius passage: possible responses are suggested — candidates do not have to mention all to gain full marks.	AO1 = 4 Level 5

Question	Answer	Marks	Guida	Guidance	
	Indicative content			Levels of response	
(b)	 AO2: Understanding despite the lack of paths/ tracks these were constructed: the making of an 'adequate pathway' for the horses and pack animals in one day the Numidians' efforts to build up the path so the elephants could cross Role of Hannibal's leadership here: Hannibal ordered his whole army to descend from the mountains ('the precipitous area') to the plains Hannibal 'gathered his whole army together and continued his descent'. 	4	Using details from Passage 2A, explain why the Carthaginians were still able to complete this journey successfully. Need to link details in the passage with an explanation of how the Carthaginians were able to overcome the difficulties that they faced – key points are suggested: highest marks will cover most of these.	AO2 = 4 Level 5	
(c)	 AO3: Interpretation and Evaluation reference to aspects of Polybius' life and method of writing: although born after these events these were within living memory he travelled widely and was able to interview persons who could have been present at or have memory of these events some judgement/ assessment needed using aspects of the above and details of the passage. 	5	In your opinion, how accurate is Polybius' account of these events in Passage 2A? Credit highly responses that contain a considerable amount of detail and understanding which is indicative of knowledge of the passage and the circumstances in which it was written.	AO3 = 5 Level 5 5 Level 4 3-4 Level 3 2 Level 1/2 0-1	

Q	uestion	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
		Indicative content			Levels of response
8	(a)	 AO1: Relevant factual knowledge Weapons: shields of Gauls and Spaniards were similar swords were different (Gauls – long/Spaniards – short) Armour: Gauls naked from the waist up/Spaniards little armour but purple edged tunics Tactics Balearic slingers/light armed troops ahead Gallic and Spanish cavalry facing the Roman cavalry on left/Numidian cavalry on right infantry in centre with Africans on flanks and Gauls/Spanish in middle Polybius 3, 113–114 supports the details of the Livy passage: do not expect mention of this but reward highly any response that makes reference to this (perhaps more relevant for AO3) Reward any reference to line excised from the passage (46.4) where Africans were armed with the 'spoils of Trasimene, but also of Trebia'. 	14	How far does this passage help us to understand the weapons, armours and tactics used by Hannibal's army at Cannae? Answers here need to be drawn from the Livy passage: possible responses could be those suggested – candidates do not have to mention all to gain full marks.	AO1 = 4 Level 5
		 AO2: Understanding passage is very useful because a great amount of detail is contained therein need for an explanation going beyond the details gleaned from Livy to show how and why Hannibal's army was 		Candidates need to explain how the passage can be useful in allowing us to understand key aspects of the Carthaginian army – weapons/armour/tactics.	AO2 = 5 Level 5 5 Level 4 3-4 Level 3 2 Level 1/2 0-1

Question	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
	Indicative content			Levels of response
	drawn up in this particular formation – balance of forces with different fighting techniques (use of swords) and neutralising Roman cavalry whilst being able to use advantage of Numidian cavalry.			
	AO3: Evaluation and Interpretation of the source			
	 there is considerable detail given here by Livy which gives a clear picture of the organisation of Hannibal's army with some explicit details about weapons/ armour and tactics reward highly candidates that might make reference to Livy 21, 21–22 as comparison/ support for the details in the stated passage reward highly responses that make some assessment of the accuracy and reliability of Livy as a source here: are these details likely to be accurate? what aims does Livy have in writing history? reward highly any reference to/comparison with Polybius 3,113–114 here. 		Evaluation of Livy as a source – the passage is quite detailed: expect some discussion as to how Livy would have known about these details. What sources would Livy have consulted or just accepted in writing his history.	AO3 = 5 Level 5 5 Level 4 3-4 Level 3 2 Level 1/2 0-1

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance		
	Indicative content			Levels of response	
(b)	 AO1: Factual details for highest marks responses need to make reference to other battles apart from just Cannae (ie Trasimene and Trebia for example) considerable detail in the passage that is specifically relevant to Cannae: deployment of troops and balance of forces (see AO1 for question 8a) Hannibal 'deployed them in position as they crossed the river': ie an awareness of need for military order and precision from the outset Livy 21, 21–22 supports the diverse and balanced nature of Hannibal's armed forces and how these should be strategically employed across the theatre of war (ie across the Carthaginian empire – Sicily/Spain/Carthage/Italy) other sources give evidence of Hannibal's military victories over Rome: Trasimene in Polybius 3.81.12–85.7 Cannae in Livy 22.44–52 candidates may well refer to other military engagements such as Ticinus and Trebia possible reference to Plutarch's Life of Fabius 5.3 and fact that Hannibal 'alone understood his opponent's strategy and realised how intelligently he applied it'. 	18	How useful are the ancient sources in helping us to understand Hannibal's success at Cannae and in the earlier battles against Rome? Remember that the question is asking for reference to the passage (as well as other sources) so reward highly those responses that do this. Some examples of this are detailed below although candidates do not have to mention all to gain full marks.	AO1 = 5 Level 5 5 Level 4 3-4 Level 3 2 Level 1/2 0-1	

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance		
	Indicative content			Levels of response	
	AO2: Understanding Candidates need to be able to link the details in the passage and reference to other sections of Livy and Polybius to explanation of Hannibal's military success – look for lines of analysis/understanding here focussing on: tactics leadership strategy anticipation of enemies' actions deployment of forces 'ruses de guerre'.		Need to look for clear and relevant explanations here as to why Hannibal was such a successful military general.	AO2 = 5 Level 5	
	AO3: Interpretation, Evaluation and Response Livy and Polybius are very useful in so far as they give clear and wide-ranging information as to the character, skills and military effectiveness of Hannibal: there is also considerable detail on Trasimene and Cannae in the prescribed sources.		Need for evaluation of passage but also other source references – Livy and Polybius. Credit highly those students who bring in a reference to and discussion of other sources.	AO3 = 8 Level 5 7-8 Level 4 5-6 Level 3 3-4 Level 1/2 0-2	
	There needs to be some discussion of how accurate and reliable Livy and Polybius are as sources. Livy: Iived well after the events that he is describing here unlike Polybius, he did not travel to places he was writing about relied on earlier sources such as Polybius some discussion of Livy's aims as a historian.				

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance	
	Indicative content		Levels of response	
	Polybius: reference to aspects of Polybius' life and method of writing although born after these events were within living memory he travelled widely and was able to interview persons who could have been present at or have memory of these events.			

Question	Answer	Marks	Guida	nce
	Indicative content			Levels of response
9	AO1: Factual detail Some detail needed on the longer-term background to the end of the war after Cannae as well as the shorter-term context of the battle of Zama focussing on: Roman strengths: • maintained the army in Spain after Cannae which prevented resources reaching Hannibal in Italy (defeat of Hasdrubal at Ibera in 215) • regained military strength through rapidly rebuilding her manpower (stringent measures here) and maintaining naval superiority • returned to Fabius' delaying tactics after Cannae which undermined Carthaginian military strengths and neutralised Hannibal's effectiveness in Italy • role of Scipio: personal and military qualities/ alliance with Numidians (Syphax and Masinissa)/ strategic confidence in crossing from Sicily and taking the war to Carthage/his generalship at Zama which turned the tables on Hannibal (Polybius 10.2–3/14.1–11/15.1–18) Carthaginian weaknesses: • the growing failure of Hannibal's campaign in Italy after Cannae as he failed to take Rome (probably for good reasons) and despite some isolated successes became bogged down in a	30	'Carthaginians weaknesses, not Roman strengths, explain the victory over Hannibal.' Using Livy's account, explain how far you agree with this view of the war with Hannibal after the battle of Cannae. Important factual details need to be referenced here – some suggestions are provided: do not expect all to be covered to award full marks in this section.	AO1 = 10 Level 5

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance		
	Indicative content			Levels of response	
	 war of attrition and was eventually forced on the defensive inability of Carthage to resupply and reinforce the army in Italy (loss of Sicily in 212/ death of Hasdrubal in 207/ Mago in 205) failure of Carthaginian attempts to widen the war to bring greater pressure to bear on Rome – interventions in Sardinia/ Macedon/ Sicily failed role of Hannibal; despite some acknowledged brilliance (in the sources) at Zama, ultimately he was outthought and outfought by Scipio (Livy 22.30–35 and Polybius 9.24–6/11.19) knowledge of the relevant sources – most likely Livy 22.51 and 30–35 (exceptionally some might make reference to Polybius). 				
	 AO2: Understanding There is a danger that some responses may be a straightforward account of the battle of Zama – this will not gain the higher mark levels in AO2 The focus of the question is 215–202 BC: reward highly those responses that cover the period, construct an explanation and make relative judgements. The most likely explanation will be drawn from both parts of the question but a response that argues convincingly for and/or against either factor should be able to access highest mark bands in AO2. 		As indicated in AO1, for higher marks candidates must address the question and not simply recount narratives of the key battle – there may be a variety of explanations here: reward relevant and justifiable explanation.	AO2 = 10 Level 5 8-10 Level 4 6-7 Level 3 4-5 Level 2 2-3 Level 1 0-1	

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance			
	Indicative content			Levels of response		
	 AO3: Interpretation, Evaluation and Response Awareness that the prescribed source material here is limited: Livy is the primary source here (particularly as identified in AO1 and the focus on the leadership roles of Hannibal and Scipio) although reward highly any reference to relevant sections of Polybius (also indicated in AO1) there needs to be some discussion and evaluation of how accurate and reliable Livy is as a source: lived well after the events that he is describing here unlike Polybius, he did not travel to places he was writing about relied on earlier sources such as Polybius: certainly Polybius books 14 and 15 would support much of Livy's views and the central place of Scipio in the final Roman victory but Livy may well just be reiterating Polybius' conclusions here. it is possible that there will be some discussion of the Preface which outlines Livy's aims as a historian where he wishes to offer models of behaviour (eg the pre – 'so many good examples to follow') and the sense that Scipio is one of these: however Livy is at pains to emphasise Hannibal's qualities at all times: 		Need to evaluate Livy as a source here – the evidence that he may have had access to, the reasons for and context within which he is writing.	AO3 = 10 Level 5 8-10 Level 4 6-7 Level 3 4-5 Level 2 2-3 Level 1 0-1		

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance	
	Indicative content		Levels of response	
	 is this a realistic assessment of Scipio's role? is this to make Scipio's achievements all the more admirable? 			
	SPaG Spelling, punctuation and grammar are assessed using the SPaG grid at the end of this mark scheme.	6	High performance 5–6 Intermediate performance 3–4 Threshold performance 1–2	

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance Levels of response		
	Indicative content				
10	 AO1: Factual details Consequences for Rome – these can be divided into: negative: general war-weariness amongst much of the population (although not all); devastation of much of Italy; economic cost of war and bankruptcy; growing imperial obligations/burdens as new provinces were coming under Rome's control and needed administration (Africa/Spain/Macedon/Greece/Sicily/Sardinia/Corsica by 146 BC) positive: defeat of Carthage now meant that Rome controlled the Western Mediterranean – no power here that could challenge Roman imperial ambitions with consequent economic/commercial and military benefits; Rome also spreading influence Eastwards (Macedon/Syria) although this control not yet assured. Consequences for Carthage – generally more negative: political: could live as free men under their own laws military: whole fleet except for 10 warships to be handed over to Rome social; deserters and POWs had to be returned/100 hostages between ages of 14-30 chosen by Scipio, handed over to Rome 	30	'The consequences of the victory at Zama were good for Rome and bad for Carthage.' How far do you agree with this view? Important factual details need to be referenced here – some suggestions are provided: do not expect all to be covered to award full marks in this section.	AO1 = 10 Level 5 8-10 Level 4 6-7 Level 3 4-5 Level 2 2-3 Level 1 0-1	

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance		
	Indicative content			Levels of response	
	 economic: could keep their pre-war trading centres and territorial possessions/indemnity of 10,000 talents to be paid over 50 years diplomatic: not allowed to make war on any nation in Africa without permission of SPQR and forbidden to make war beyond Africa/had to restore all lands to Masinissa – Carthage now became a dependent ally of Rome and vulnerable to any aggressor in Africa (notably Masinissa). AO2: Understanding one would expect the majority of responses to focus on the period immediately after the battle of Zama in order to assess the impact of war: some candidates may take a longer view and make comparisons with the status quo ante and post bellum and the changes in the respective positions of Rome and Carthage the specification does identify 146 BC as the 'cut-off' point: do not expect coverage up to this date but reward highly responses that refer to a wider/longer time period also it is to be expected that responses will focus on 'good for Rome' and 'bad for Carthage': reward highly also candidates that are more nuanced in their approach – ie see Rome's position after Zama as containing 		Effective answers will put the consequences of the end of the war into a context and will assess the impacts that victory/defeat had for both of the main combatants.	AO2 = 10 Level 5 8-10 Level 4 6-7 Level 3 4-5 Level 2 2-3 Level 1 0-1	

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance		
	Indicative content			Levels of response	
	difficulties/problems as well as successes It should be possible to access the highest mark levels whatever the approach as long as answers address the question in a cogent and analytical manner. AO3: Interpretation, Evaluation and Response sources here are limited: expect reference to Livy – particularly Livy 30.37.1–7 – which explains clearly the conditions imposed upon Carthage. This extract is in the unabridged translations of Livy [Livy 30.43–44 describes the imposition of the treaty and problems with the first instalment of the indemnity] the details in the Livy passage are supported by Polybius 15,18–19 but evidence for the impact on Rome is even more limited evaluation of Livy needs to take into account the context within which Livy is writing: many years after these events considerable reliance upon Polybius ('an authority by no means to be despised') which is particularly relevant in this specific case and other sources		Evaluation of Livy as a source – the passage dealing with the Carthaginian peace is quite detailed: expect some discussion as to how Livy would have known about these details. What sources would Livy have consulted or just accepted in writing his history. Given the limited nature of the evidence/source material responses in AO3 will need to be assessed flexibly.	AO3 = 10 Level 5 8-10 Level 4 6-7 Level 3 4-5 Level 2 2-3 Level 1 0-1	

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance	
	Indicative content		Levels of response	
	thus some assessment of Polybius is necessary here. Livy's aims in writing history/presenting these events in a particular way (reference to Livy's Preface?).			
	SPaG Spelling, punctuation and grammar are assessed using the SPaG grid at the end of this mark scheme.	6	High performance 5–6 Intermediate performance 3–4 Threshold performance 1–2	

APPENDIX 1

GCSE Ancient History: Marking Grids for Section A

	AO1 (Recall, Sele	ct, Organise)	AO2 (Und	erstand)	AO3 (Interpret, E	valuate, Respond)
	4	5	4	5	5	7–8
Level 5	Answers contain thorough knowledge of		Answers demonstrate a		Answers interpret, analyse and evaluate evidence	
Thorough	the events, sources and issues relevant to		thorough und	derstanding	thoroughly and reach re	asoned and substantiated
	the question.		of issues, eve	nts, and	conclusions.	
	Information is detailed, t	horoughly	sources releva	ant to the	They construct an informed personal response	
	relevant, well selected a	nd organised.	question.		based on thorough evalu	uation and interpretation
					of the source material.	
Level 4	3	3–4	3	3–4	3–4	5–6
Sound	Answers contain sound	knowledge of the	Answers dem	onstrate a	Answers interpret, analys	
	events, sources and issu	ues relevant to most	sound unders	standing of	and draw relevant conclusions.	
	of the question.		issues, events	•	They offer a personal response based on sound	
	Information is sound , re	levant and	sources relevant to most		evaluation and interpretation of the source	
	organised.		of the question	n.	material.	
Level 3	2		2		2	
Some	Answers contain some l	knowledge of the	Answers show some understanding of issues, events, and sources		Answers include some ev	valuation and
	events, sources and issu	ues relevant to			interpretation of evidence and draw at least	
	some of the question.				partially relevant conclusions.	
	There is some evidence	of selection and	relevant to so	me of the	They offer a personal response based on some of	
	organisation of informati	on.	question.		the source material.	
Level 1/2	0–1		0-	1	0–1	0–2
Limited/None	Answers contain limited	l or no knowledge	Answers show	v limited or	Answers offer limited or	no evaluation. They offer
	of events, sources and is		no understanding of		a personal response base	ed on limited or no
	Information that has bee	n included is	events or sources.		evidence, or no response	
	disorganised and has lir	nited or no				
	relevance.					

GCSE Ancient History: Marking Grids for Section B

	AO1 (Recall, Select, Organise)	AO2 (Understand)	AO3 (Interpret, Evaluate, Respond)
	8–10	8–10	8–10
Level 5 Thorough	Answers contain thorough knowledge of the events, sources and issues relevant to the question. Information is detailed, thoroughly relevant, well selected and organised. Text is legible and spelling, grammar and punctuation are accurate. Meaning is communicated clearly.	Answers demonstrate a thorough understanding of issues, events, and sources relevant to the question.	Answers interpret, analyse and evaluate evidence thoroughly and reach reasoned and substantiated conclusions. They construct an informed personal response based on thorough evaluation and interpretation of the source material.
Level 4	6–7	6–7	6–7
Sound	Answers contain sound knowledge of the events, sources and issues relevant to most of the question. Information is sound , relevant and organised. Text is legible and spelling, grammar and punctuation are mostly accurate. Meaning is communicated clearly.	Answers demonstrate a sound understanding of issues, events, and sources relevant to most of the question.	Answers interpret, analyse and evaluate evidence and draw relevant conclusions. They offer a personal response based on sound evaluation and interpretation of the source material.
Level 3	4–5	4–5	4–5
Some/Partial	Answers contain some knowledge of the events, sources and issues relevant to some of the question. There is some evidence of selection and organisation of information. Text is legible. There are mistakes in spelling, grammar and punctuation however meaning is still communicated clearly for most of the answer.	Answers show some understanding of issues, events, and sources relevant to some of the question.	Answers include some evaluation and interpretation of evidence and draw at least partially relevant conclusions. They offer a personal response based on some of the source material.

	AO1 (Recall, Select, Organise)	AO2 (Understand)	AO3 (Interpret, Evaluate, Respond)
Level 2	2–3	2–3	2–3
Limited	Answers contain limited knowledge of the events, sources and issues relevant to parts of the question. There is limited evidence of selection or organisation of information. Text is sometimes illegible and there are mistakes in spelling, grammar and punctuation, which sometimes hinder communication.	Answers show limited understanding of events and sources.	Answers draw limited conclusions based on the evidence they have included. Answers offer a personal response at a limited level.
Level 1	0–1	0–1	0–1
Minimal/None	Answers contain minimal or no knowledge of events, sources and issues. Information that has been included is disorganised and has minimal or no relevance. Text is often illegible. Frequent mistakes in spelling, grammar and punctuation impede communication of meaning.	Answers show minimal or no understanding of events or sources.	Answers offer a minimal personal response, without reference to evidence, or no response.

APPENDIX 2

Spelling, punctuation and grammar (SPaG) assessment grid

High performance 5-6 marks

Candidates spell, punctuate and use rules of grammar with consistent accuracy and effective control of meaning in the context of the demands of the question. Where required, they use a wide range of specialist terms adeptly and with precision.

Intermediate performance 3-4 marks

Candidates spell, punctuate and use rules of grammar with considerable accuracy and general control of meaning in the context of the demands of the question. Where required, they use a good range of specialist terms with facility.

Threshold performance 1-2 marks

Candidates spell, punctuate and use rules of grammar with reasonable accuracy in the context of the demands of the question. Any errors do not hinder meaning in the response. Where required, they use a limited range of specialist terms appropriately.

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)
1 Hills Road
Cambridge
CB1 2EU

OCR Customer Contact Centre

Education and Learning

Telephone: 01223 553998 Facsimile: 01223 552627

Email: general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk

www.ocr.org.uk

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored

Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations is a Company Limited by Guarantee Registered in England Registered Office; 1 Hills Road, Cambridge, CB1 2EU Registered Company Number: 3484466 OCR is an exempt Charity

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)

Head office

Telephone: 01223 552552 Facsimile: 01223 552553



