
GCSE

History A

91402A The American West, 1840–1895

Mark scheme

9140

June 2016

Version: 1.0 Final

Mark schemes are prepared by the Lead Assessment Writer and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation events which all associates participate in and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation process ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every associate understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for standardisation each associate analyses a number of students' scripts. Alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed and legislated for. If, after the standardisation process, associates encounter unusual answers which have not been raised they are required to refer these to the Lead Assessment Writer.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this mark scheme are available from aqa.org.uk

1 (a) What do **Sources A** and **B** suggest about the Plains Indians? [4 marks]

Target:	Comprehension and inference from historical sources (AO3: 4 marks)	
	Students either submit no evidence or fail to address the question.	0
Level 1:	Answers that select details from the sources Eg Source B shows the Indians attacking a log cabin and they are stealing a calf and horse.	1
Level 2:	Answers that draw a simple inference from the sources Eg the picture shows that the Indians are dangerous. They are violent. Eg the Indians in Source A are lazy.	2-3
Level 3:	Answers that develop a complex inference from the sources Eg Source A suggests that the Indians are not prepared to work hard and take an easy option which is to steal what they want (Source B).	4

1 (b) What different view of the Plains Indians is suggested by **Sources C** and **D**? Explain your answer using **Sources A, B, C** and **D**. [6 marks]

Target:	Comprehension and inference from historical sources (AO2: 2 and AO3: 4 marks)	
	Students either submit no evidence or fail to address the question.	0
Level 1:	Answers that select details from Sources C and/or D Eg Source C shows that the Indians are sitting quietly.	1-2
Level 2:	Answers based on a comparison of details in source(s) C/D and Source(s) A/B. Eg the impression in Source A is that the Indians are no good but in Source D they have been badly treated. OR Answers based on simple inference(s) from source(s) C/D and Source(s) A/B Eg the impression in Source C is that the Indians get along fine with the white people they have been to meet the President's wife.	3-4
Level 3:	Answers based on complex inferences in Sources C/D and Source(s) A/B Eg in Source A the impression is one of threat but that is not the case in Source C they sit side by side with the whites for a photograph. In Source D the Indians are noble and civilised and have been misjudged as they were in Source A. Whereas Source A condemns them to extinction, 'these people must die out' it says, but the Source D sees a bright future for them as converts to Christianity and 'civilised Red brothers'.	5-6

1 (c)	Why do you think Sources A and B give a different view to Sources C and D ? Explain your answer using Sources A, B, C and D and your knowledge .	[8 marks]
Target:	Deduction and understanding of the different ideas and attitudes and how they might be related to different circumstances (AO1: 2 marks, AO2: 2 marks and AO3: 4 marks)	0
	Students either submit no evidence or fail to address the question.	
Level 1:	Answers that select details from sources OR answers that say how the sources are different Eg they are different because Source B is a painting and Source C is a photograph.	1-2
	The answer demonstrates simple understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is generally coherent but basic in development.	
Level 2:	Answers that show simple reasoning based on the differences in place, or author, or time, or audience. Eg Sources A and B are from the 1850s whereas Sources C and D are later in 1863 and 1880. The author of Source A is a journalist but Source D is written by a Bishop.	3-4
	The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is reasonably well organised and presented in a clear and effective manner.	
Level 3	Answers that show developed reasoning based on the differences in ONE of the following – place, author, time, or audience. Answers will probably be based on how the authors acquired information or their intentions in writing. Eg Source A describes when the first contacts with Indians was made and they might appear to a journalist who want to sell newspapers to white people who are the ones who can read that the Indians are worthless or as in Source B they are a danger to everyone on the Plains. However the Bishop is a good Christian and sees the Indians as not having someone like Greeley to speak up for them. As a Christian he believes all men are equal and recognises that the Indians have been ill treated by whites and deserve better. He wants to save their heathen souls for Christ. Whipple believes that they should sit side by side with whites as they do in Source C at the White House.	5-6
	The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well organised with an appropriate form and style of writing. Some specialist vocabulary is used.	
Level 4	Answers that develop out of level 3 and provide some	7-8

explanation of the links between reasons for the sources differences.

Eg the difference in time shows the influence of the Humanitarians like Bishop Whipple. The Exterminators and the army have had a chance to hasten what Greeley believes is the natural conclusion of the native Americans’ existences – to die out! Sources C and D show a different way of dealing with the ‘Indian Problem’ which involves negotiating in good faith and winning them over with trips like in Source C and a chance to see the white mans’ power in the big cities of the East coast.

The answer demonstrates highly developed/complex understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well structured, with an appropriate form and style of writing. Specialist vocabulary is used effectively.

- 1 (d) How useful is **Source E** for understanding attitudes to the Plains Indians? Explain your answer using **Source E** and **your knowledge**.

[8 marks]

Target: An evaluation of utility (AO1: 2 marks, AO2: 2 marks and AO3: 4 marks)

Students either submit no evidence or fail to address the question. **0**

Level 1: Answers that assert a source or sources is/are useful or not because it/they tell(s) us something about the Plains Indians or attitudes to the Plains Indians **1-2**

Answers may select details from the sources to support the answer. Eg Source E is useful because it shows the Indians coiling round the white woman and child with the man dead beside them.

The answer demonstrates simple understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is generally coherent but basic in development.

Level 2: Answers that explain that one source is useful or not because of its *provenance* in relation to understanding attitudes to the Plains Indians **3-4**

Eg Source E is useful because it shows that by 1885 the Indians were still considered to be a problem because they are making a cartoon about them.

OR

Answers that explain that Source E is useful or not through an understanding of its *content* in relation to understanding attitudes to the Plains Indians

Eg Source E is useful because it shows that by 1885 they still did not like the Indians thinking they were like a snakes.

The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of

spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is reasonably well organised and presented in a clear and effective manner.

Level 3: Answers that appreciate and explain the value of the source because of its provenance and an understanding of its content in relation to understanding attitudes to the Plains Indians **5-6**

Eg Source E is useful because it shows that although many Indians were on reservations they were still considered to be a problem because they attacked white people and committed atrocities like killing and burning their homes. The image of Uncle Sam shows criticism of the government feeding the snake that represents the Indians. As over 100,000 people might see this cartoon the artist must think that it will be well received and represent the views of many white people.

The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well organised with an appropriate form and style of writing. Some specialist vocabulary is used.

Level 4: Answers that explain the usefulness of the source by commenting in detail on both its provenance and of its content in relation to understanding attitudes to the Plains Indians. **7-8**

Eg it suggests that Uncle Sam's kindness in feeding the Indian and giving them educational programmes is not being respected by the Indians as they continue to behave like an animal – a snake – that accepts what is given and takes what else it wants. The government is the centre of the criticism from the 'Judge's' readership for being high up on a hill away from what is really happening down on the ground in the valley.

The answer demonstrates highly developed/complex understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well structured, with an appropriate form and style of writing. Specialist vocabulary is used effectively.

1 (e) How was the Indian 'problem' solved after Custer's defeat at the Battle of Little Big Horn in 1876?

[10 marks]

Target: An understanding and evaluation of causation (AO1 & AO2 5+5 marks)

Students either submit no evidence or fail to address the question. **0**

Level 1: Answers that provide general statements, describe single factors or factual details of how was the Indian 'problem' solved. **1-2**

Eg they killed the Indians and the others went onto reservations.

The answer demonstrates simple understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is generally coherent but basic

in development.

Level 2: Answers that comment briefly on several factors, to do with how was the Indian ‘problem’ solved 3-5

Eg the whites killed the buffalo, they put the Indians in reservations, they killed any who refused to go there, they tried to destroy the culture of the Indians and replace it with white culture. They gave the Indians land so they could all become farmers like white people.

OR

Answers that identify and explain one factor, in depth to do with how was the Indian ‘problem’ solved

Eg the whites used reservations to control the Indians from 1825. This kept Indians away from homesteaders. Conditions on the reservations were poor. The land they got was not wanted by settlers and therefore hard to farm. The Indians became dependent on the whites for food and clothing. This was demoralising for proud Indians. They tended to catch the disease of the whites on reservations like measles and flu for which they had no immunity.

The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is reasonably well organised and presented in a clear and effective manner.

Level 3: Answers that recognise and explain several factors to do with how was the Indian ‘problem’ solved in specific detail 6-8

Eg the Indian problem was solved indirectly by the destruction of the buffalo. The whites knew what this would do and whilst they did not actively make it government policy, they did not stand in the way of the destruction. The railroad ensured that the hides of the buffalo found a ready market. In many places the army encouraged the buffalo hunters with ammunition. The army also helped solve the Indian problem by pursuing the Indians after the ‘distraction’ of the Civil War ended in 1865. The army carried out winter campaigning and practised total war which forced the Indians onto reservations. The superior manpower and firepower of the whites was decisive. The longer-term winning of the battle for the Plains came with the education of young Indians on the Reservations so that they would not go back to their old ways of nomadic hunting. The whites solved the Indian problem by educating the young Indians in boarding schools (2020 in 1887) and day schools (2500) so that they spoke English and if they resisted their rations were stopped.

The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well organised with an appropriate form and style of writing. Some specialist vocabulary is used.

Level 4: Answers that develop out of level 3 and evaluate the relative importance of individual factors or come to a summary assessment about the factors involved or provide details of the links between factors 9-10

Eg the whites solved the Indian problem by ensuring that there was no way back for them to their old culture based on being nomadic hunter gatherers. They destroyed the economic basis for it by killing the buffalo and destroyed the culture by educating the children on the reservations. The Dawes General Allotment Act gave them land and at the same time helped to destroy the bonds of tribal loyalty and the traditional power of the chiefs.

The answer demonstrates highly developed/ complex understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well structured, with an appropriate form and style of writing. Specialist vocabulary is used effectively.

2 (a) Why was the Timber and Culture Act important?

[4 marks]

Target: Understanding of the key features of the period (AO1 & AO2 2+2 marks)

Students either submit no evidence or fail to address the question. **0**

Level 1: Explanation shows recognition and simple understanding of the key feature mentioned in the question **1-2**
Answers will show simple recognition of the Timber and Culture Act

Eg the Timber and Culture Act gave settlers 160 acres of free land provided they planted 40 acres with trees.

Level 2: Explanation shows understanding in a broader context of the period **3-4**
Answers will show knowledge of some distinctive features of the Timber and Culture Act

Eg the Timber and Culture Act gave extra free land to homesteaders. They received another 160 acres if they planted trees. This acknowledged that the Homestead Act in 1862 did not give people enough land to live on successfully. It may have been enough back east but not on the uncultivated land of the plains – it was a struggle to feed a family. The homesteader in return had to plant 40 acres of trees and this eventually provided fuel for the home, timber for building and broke up the flatness and desolate landscape of the Plains making it easier to farm.

2 (b) Study **Source F** in the Sources Booklet.

Using **Source F** and **your knowledge**, explain the role of women homesteaders on the Great Plains.

[8 marks]

Target:	Understanding of the key features of the period (AO1: 3 marks, AO2: 3 marks and AO3: 2 marks)	
	Students either submit no evidence or fail to address the question.	0
Level 1:	Discusses the source only OR Describes the role of women Homesteaders on the Great Plains Eg women on the Plains would have to work at farming. They had to look after the crops and do weeding.	1-2
	The answer demonstrates simple understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is generally coherent but basic in development.	
Level 2:	Considers a singular cause (probably based upon the source offered) and/or mentions other aspects related to the role of women Homesteaders on the Great Plains Eg the women were farmers and mothers. They had to look after the sod house. It was very difficult to keep clean and insects came down the walls and there was rain that came through gaps in the roof. They had to look after the children, raise them and care for them.	3-5
	The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is reasonably well organised and presented in a clear and effective manner.	
Level 3:	Explains more than one cause related to the role of women Homesteaders on the Great Plains. At this level responses will explain more than one or two aspects apart from those suggested in the source provided. Eg the lives of women homesteaders was very demanding as mothers, wives and workers. They had to give birth to children and look after them in dangerous and unhygienic conditions. Due to the work, the climate and the soil the sod house was built of the inside was very difficult to keep clean. There was also the problem of loneliness as these women had often left family and friends behind to move west. They might be miles from a neighbour and could have no social life. The women had to help the men in the fields as well. They did farming work helping the men with hoeing, and watering and harvesting the crops. They might also have to look after a small number of animals.	6-8
	The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well organised with an appropriate form and style of writing. Some specialist vocabulary is used.	

2 (c) 'The greatest problem which faced homesteaders was the climate.'

How far do you agree with this interpretation of the problems faced by the homesteaders? Explain your answer.

[12 marks]
[SPaG 4 marks]

**Target: Understanding, analysis and evaluation of an interpretation.
(AO1=2 marks, AO2 = 2 marks and AO3 = 8 marks)**

Students either submit no evidence or fail to address the question. **0**

Level 1: Simple descriptive comment or comments about the interpretation **1-2**

Eg the climate was harsh. It had great variations in temperature – it could be hot in the day and very cold at night. There were dust storms and winds that swept across the plains and hailstones.

The answer demonstrates simple understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is generally coherent but basic in development.

Level 2: Identifies or describes briefly different ways in which the issue has been interpreted **3-6**

Eg I disagree because many things were problems - getting something to grow was a big problem and then keep it growing. None of the crops or tools the homesteaders brought with them from the East worked well on the Plains. Getting enough water was a great problem. Having enough land to feed your family was another. The land was hard and tools broke.

OR

Answers that explain one interpretation demonstrating some depth of knowledge and understanding and /or explain how the interpretation came about

May explain the interpretation on the basis of an analysis in depth of eg one of the following:

Eg environmental problems – fire, insects, lack of water, weather technical problems – size of land holding, problems of growing and crop type, absence of machinery, toughness of land, protection of crops

May explain how interpretation came about on basis of:

Eg contemporary diaries, journalism, images, failed homesteader letters and accounts etc.

The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is reasonably well organised and presented in a clear and effective manner.

Level 3:	<p>Answers that explain more than one interpretation in depth. Answers will provide some evaluation of the history on which the interpretations are based and may assess the validity of the interpretations and / or explain how the interpretation came about</p>	7-10
	<p>Will explain more than one interpretation of the problem as specified at L2 above</p>	
	<p>The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well organised with an appropriate form and style of writing. Some specialist vocabulary is used.</p>	
Level 4:	<p>Analyses how and why different interpretations have come about. An analytical answer which clearly links interpretations and/or reaches a supported judgement about the validity of the interpretations through the use of historical evidence and/or context. Answers will emerge out of level 3.</p>	11-12
	<p>Eg on balance, the interpretation is only partly valid. Although the importance of the climate affected everything they grew, the big problem was that the types of wheat did not grow well. The homesteaders who failed went back East with tales of the difficulties. The technology did not exist in the early days to make the Plains produce food. When technology provided answers to the harsh landscape, the climate could be made to work for the homesteaders. Newspaper reports at the time had an interest in hiding the reality but later diary entries from successful homesteaders show what could be achieved with resilience.</p>	
	<p>The answer demonstrates highly developed/complex understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well structured, with an appropriate form and style of writing. Specialist vocabulary is used effectively.</p>	
SPaG	Threshold performance	1
	<p>Students spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with reasonable accuracy in the context of the demands of the question. Any errors do not hinder meaning in the response. Where required, they use a limited range of specialist terms appropriately.</p>	
	Intermediate performance	2-3
	<p>Students spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with considerable accuracy and general control of meaning in the context of the demands of the question. Where required, they use a good range of specialist terms with facility.</p>	
	High performance	4
	<p>Students spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with consistent accuracy and effective control of meaning in the context of the demands of the question. Where required, they use a wide range of specialist terms adeptly and with precision.</p>	

3 (a) Why was Joseph Smith important?

[4 marks]

Target: Understanding of the key features of the period (AO1 and AO2 2+2 marks)

Students either submit no evidence or fail to address the question. **0**

Level 1: Explanation shows recognition and simple understanding of the key feature mentioned in the question **1-2**

Answers will show simple recognition of Joseph Smith.

Eg Joseph Smith was the founder of the Mormon religion and their leader.

Level 2: Explanation shows understanding in a broader context of the period **3-4**

Answers will show knowledge of some distinctive aspects of the role of Joseph Smith.

Eg Joseph Smith published 'The Book of Mormon'. He was inspired by the angel 'Moroni'. Smith set about building Christ's kingdom on earth. They were God's special people on earth.

3 (b) Study **Source G** in the Sources Booklet.

Using **Source G** and **your knowledge**, explain how the Mormons made a successful settlement at the Great Salt Lake in Utah.

[8 marks]

Target: Understanding of the key features of the period (AO1: 3 marks, AO2: 3 marks and AO3: 2 marks)

Students either submit no evidence or fail to address the question. **0**

Level 1: Discusses the source only **1-2**
OR

Describes Mormon journey or settlement.

Eg the Mormons had a Perpetual Emigration Fund which meant that fresh new Mormons arrived to increase the size of the settlement.

The answer demonstrates simple understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is generally coherent but basic in development.

Level 2: Considers a singular aspect (probably based upon the source offered) and/or mentions other aspects related to how the Mormons made a successful settlement at the Great Salt Lake in Utah **3-5**

Eg the Mormons put a lot of work into the Irrigation system and this watered the land of everyone fairly. The land was owned by the Mormon church and given out to everyone according to need or the size of the family. So the Mormons settled successfully because they

worked together with everyone accepting the church decisions and it was fair for everyone.

The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is reasonably well organised and presented in a clear and effective manner.

Level 3: Explains more than one aspect related to how the Mormons made a successful settlement at the Great Salt Lake in Utah
At this level responses will explain more than one or two aspects apart from those suggested in the source. **6-8**

Eg the Mormons were lucky that no one else wanted the land. Initially it belonged to Mexico so they were free of US government control. The church gave everyone a sense of purpose and as they had been persecuted for their faith in the East they all had an incentive to make it work. Polygamy was an effective way of increasing the population to maximum. When the US government did take over Utah the Mormon leader, Brigham Young, negotiated with them and also showed he was prepared to use force. Mormons were helped by the local Ute Indians. They shared out the land fairly...

The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well organised with an appropriate form and style of writing. Some specialist vocabulary is used.

3 (c) 'The main reason why the Mormons were unpopular in the East was because they practised polygamy.'

How far do you agree with this interpretation of why the Mormons were unpopular in the East? Explain your answer.

[12 marks]
[SPaG 4 marks]

Target: Understanding, analysis and evaluation of an interpretation
(AO1: 2 marks, AO2: 2 marks and AO3: 8 marks)

Students either submit no evidence or fail to address the question. **0**

Level 1: Simple descriptive comment or comments about the interpretation. **1-2**

Eg the Mormon bank went bust and people lost money.

The answer demonstrates simple understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is generally coherent but basic in development.

Level 2: EITHER Identifies or describes briefly different ways in which the issue has been interpreted **3-6**

Eg I agree because the Mormons had more than one wife. This is polygamy. Non-Mormons were shocked by this. It went against

Christian teaching. Many non-Mormons thought it would lead to there being more Mormons than non-Mormons. I disagree because the Danite army scared non-Mormons that they would use force to take over. The Mormon leader, Joseph Smith wanted to become President. They had a friendly attitude to slaves and native Indians. Mormons. Mormons made sure everyone knew that they were different and blessed.

OR

Answers that explain one interpretation demonstrating some depth of knowledge and understanding and /or explain how the interpretation came about

May explain the interpretation on the basis of an analysis in depth of eg one of the following:

Eg Danites, Polygamy, attitude to slaves, Indians, Mormon Bank, economic success, Mormon numbers increased, considered themselves an elite.

May explain how interpretation came about on basis of:

Eg contemporary and modern Mormon perception that Young was inspired by God, Young's own published accounts, Gentile representations in the media

The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is reasonably well organised and presented in a clear and effective manner.

Level 3: Answers that explain more than one interpretation in depth. Answers will provide some evaluation of the history on which the interpretations are based and may assess the validity of the interpretations and / or explain how the interpretation came about **7-10**

Will explain **more than one** interpretation of the issues as specified at level 2 above.

The answer demonstrates developed understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well organised with an appropriate form and style of writing. Some specialist vocabulary is used.

Level 4: Analyses how and why different interpretations have come about. **11-12**

An analytical answer which clearly links interpretations and/or reaches a supported judgement about the validity of the interpretations through the use of historical evidence and/or context. Answers will emerge out of Level 3.

Eg the Mormons upset many non-Mormons with their polygamy. Joseph Smith had more than one wife and his bodyguard, John Scott, had five wives. Even some Mormons thought polygamy was wrong. Non-Mormons feared the Mormons would outbreed them and

that polygamy was immoral. The Mormons had their own army the Danites. To many non-Mormons this also pointed to a Mormon takeover. When Joseph Smith wanted to stand for President of the United States they were really alarmed. Some Mormons supported the Indians and slaves. These attitudes and ideas upset other white people. They voiced their concerns in the press and demonstrated it by their violent attitudes which were then reported.

The answer demonstrates highly developed/complex understanding of the rules of spelling, punctuation and grammar. It is well structured, with an appropriate form and style of writing. Specialist vocabulary is used effectively.

SPaG	Threshold performance	1
	Students spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with reasonable accuracy in the context of the demands of the question. Any errors do not hinder meaning in the response. Where required, they use a limited range of specialist terms appropriately.	
	Intermediate performance	2-3
	Students spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with considerable accuracy and general control of meaning in the context of the demands of the question. Where required, they use a good range of specialist terms with facility.	
	High performance	4
	Students spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with consistent accuracy and effective control of meaning in the context of the demands of the question. Where required, they use a wide range of specialist terms adeptly and with precision.	