

AS-LEVEL

History

Unit HIS2B: The Church in England: The Struggle for Supremacy,
1529–1547

Mark scheme

1041
June 2015

Version 1: Final Mark Scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Lead Assessment Writer and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation events which all associates participate in and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation process ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every associate understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for standardisation each associate analyses a number of students' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed and legislated for. If, after the standardisation process, associates encounter unusual answers which have not been raised they are required to refer these to the Lead Assessment Writer.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available from aqa.org.uk

Generic Introduction for AS

The AS History specification is based on the assessment objectives laid down in QCA's GCE History subject criteria and published in the AQA specification booklet. These cover the skills, knowledge and understanding which are expected of A Level students. Most questions address more than one objective since historical skills, which include knowledge and understanding, are usually deployed together. Consequently, the marking scheme which follows is a 'levels of response' scheme and assesses students' historical skills in the context of their knowledge and understanding of History.

The levels of response are a graduated recognition of how students have demonstrated their abilities in the Assessment Objectives. Students who predominantly address AO1(a) by writing narrative or description will perform at Level 1 or Level 2 depending on its relevance. Students who provide more explanation – (AO1(b), supported by the relevant selection of material, AO1(a)) – will perform at high Level 2 or low-mid Level 3 depending on how explicit they are in their response to the question. Students who provide explanation with evaluation, judgement and an awareness of historical interpretations will be addressing all 3 AOs (AO1(a); AO1(b); AO2(a) and (b) and will have access to the higher mark ranges. AO2(a) which requires the evaluation of source material is assessed in Unit 2.

Differentiation between Levels 3, 4 and 5 is judged according to the extent to which students meet this range of assessment objectives. At Level 3 the answers will show more characteristics of the AO1 objectives, although there should be elements of AO2. At Level 4, AO2 criteria, particularly an understanding of how the past has been interpreted, will be more in evidence and this will be even more dominant at Level 5. The demands on written communication, particularly the organisation of ideas and the use of specialist vocabulary also increase through the various levels so that a student performing at the highest AS level is already well prepared for the demands of A2.

CRITERIA FOR MARKING GCE HISTORY:**AS EXAMINATION PAPERS****General Guidance for Examiners (to accompany Level Descriptors)**

Deciding on a level and the award of marks within a level

It is of vital importance that examiners familiarise themselves with the generic mark scheme and apply it consistently, as directed by the Principal Examiner, in order to facilitate comparability across options.

The indicative mark scheme for each paper is designed to illustrate some of the material that students might refer to (knowledge) and some of the approaches and ideas they might develop (skills). It is not, however, prescriptive and should only be used to exemplify the generic mark scheme.

When applying the generic mark scheme, examiners will constantly need to exercise judgement to decide which level fits an answer best. Few essays will display all the characteristics of a level, so deciding the most appropriate will always be the first task.

Each level has a range of marks and for an essay which has a strong correlation with the level descriptors the middle mark should be given. However, when an answer has some of the characteristics of the level above or below, or seems stronger or weaker on comparison with many other students' responses to the same question, the mark will need to be adjusted up or down.

When deciding on the mark within a level, the following criteria should be considered *in relation to the level descriptors*. Students should never be doubly penalised. If a student with poor communication skills has been placed in Level 2, he or she should not be moved to the bottom of the level on the basis of the poor quality of written communication. On the other hand, a student with similarly poor skills, whose work otherwise matched the criteria for Level 4 should be adjusted downwards within the level.

Criteria for deciding marks within a level:

- The accuracy of factual information
- The level of detail
- The depth and precision displayed
- The quality of links and arguments
- The quality of written communication (grammar, spelling, punctuation and legibility; an appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of ideas, including the use of specialist vocabulary)
- Appropriate references to historical interpretation and debate
- The conclusion

June 2015

GCE AS History Unit 2: Historical Issues: Periods of Change

HIS2B: The Church in England: The Struggle for Supremacy, 1529–1547

Question 1

01 Use **Sources A** and **B** and your own knowledge.

Explain how far the views in **Source B** differ from those in **Source A** in relation to Henry VIII in his last years. **[12 marks]**

Target: AO2(a)

Levels Mark Scheme

Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**

L1: Answers will **either** briefly paraphrase/describe the content of the two sources **or** identify simple comparison(s) between the sources. Skills of written communication will be weak. **1-2**

L2: Responses will compare the views expressed in the two sources and identify some differences and/or similarities. There may be some limited own knowledge. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed. **3-6**

L3: Responses will compare the views expressed in the two sources, identifying differences **and** similarities and using own knowledge to explain and evaluate these. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed. **7-9**

L4: Responses will make a developed comparison between the views expressed in the two sources and will apply own knowledge to evaluate and to demonstrate a good contextual understanding. Answers will, for the most part, show good skills of written communication. **10-12**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the levels scheme.

Students will need to identify differences between the views of the two sources. For example:

- Source A holds the view that the problem Henry VIII faced was the result of arguments between those who sought to control the government on his death. Source B holds the view that the problem was more to do with religious factors and was the result of personal rivalries and this was the main dispute

-
- Source A argues that Henry was not overcome by the problems but was in control until the very end. Source B holds the view that once he appeared to be dying he was not able to prevent himself being overwhelmed by the problems.

Students will need to apply their own knowledge of context to explain these differences. They might, for example, refer to:

- the control of the Dry Stamp by the reformist faction. Restrictions on access to Henry
- the subversion of Henry's will and his intention that Edward's minority should be administered by a balanced Privy Council
- the alternative religious settlements which might evolve and Henry's determination to ensure an Erastian Church with a catholic doctrine.

To address 'how far', students should also indicate some similarity between the sources. For example:

- the sources agree that the problems related to the security of the throne and the succession
- the sources agree that there were factions representing different interests which created problems for Henry VIII.

In making a judgement about the degree of difference, students may suggest that the two sources have different views about the relative power of Henry and factions in the last months of his life. It is also acceptable to argue that Elton is offering a broader analysis of the Tudors and is explaining the longer term development whereas Wooding has a much more focused analysis of Henry VIII.

Reward valid differences supported with accurate evidence from sources which can be developed in context of own knowledge.

Question 1

02 Use **Sources A, B and C** and your own knowledge.

How far was religion the most serious issue facing Henry VIII in the years 1541 to 1547?

[24 marks]

Target: AO1(b), AO2(a), AO2(b)

Levels Mark Scheme

Nothing written worthy of credit.

0

L1: Answers may be based on sources or on own knowledge alone, or they may comprise an undeveloped mixture of the two. They may contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question or they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, there may be some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**

L2: Answers may be based on sources or on own knowledge alone, or they may contain a mixture of the two. They may be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the focus of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment with relevant but limited support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-11**

L3: Answers will show a developed understanding of the demands of the question using evidence from **both** the sources **and** own knowledge. They will provide some assessment backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, but they will lack depth and/or balance. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **12-16**

L4: Answers will show explicit understanding of the demands of the question. They will develop a balanced argument backed by a good range of appropriately selected evidence from the sources and own knowledge, and a good understanding of historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, show organisation and good skills of written communication. **17-21**

L5: Answers will be well-focused and closely argued. The arguments will be supported by precisely selected evidence from the sources and own knowledge, incorporating well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate. Answers will, for the most part, be carefully organised and fluently written, using appropriate vocabulary. **22-24**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Students should be able to make a judgement by addressing the focus of the question and offering some balance of other factors or views. In ‘how important’ and ‘how successful questions’, the answer could be (but does not need to be) exclusively based on the focus of the question.

Students should use the sources as evidence in their answer.

Relevant material from the sources would include:

- **Source C** argues that religion was the most serious issue in the last years of Henry’s reign in terms of:
 - foreign policy was ‘complicated by religious changes’
 - domestic policy was complicated because Henry wished to maintain a catholic religious policy despite ‘the evangelical interest’ surrounding Thomas Cranmer
 - the direction of religious policy was divisive in terms of his Privy Council.
- **Source A** argues that the main problems of the last years were not to do with religion but to do with the peaceful succession.
- **Source B** also argues that the future of the dynasty was the most serious issue but that the individual factions were compromising this. The factions were divided on religious grounds.

From students’ own knowledge:

Factors suggesting that religion was serious might include:

- the emphasis placed on Henry’s religion: The King’s Book, restrictions on reading the Bible in English, the English Litany, the execution of Anne Askew. Henry’s speech to Parliament
- the importance of religious policy in ensuring the Erastian settlement for Edward’s succession – catholic doctrine but with Edward as Head of the Church of England
- factions were divided on religious lines and the evangelical faction were able to determine the ultimate religious policy.

Factors suggesting that other factors were serious might include:

- war with France and Scotland, which was more about asserting Henry’s territorial rights than asserting religious policy. England invaded France with the Holy Roman Emperor.

Good answers are likely to/may conclude that religion underpinned everything and was the determining factor in the succession.

Care should be taken with evidence from before 1541 unless directly related to the years 1541-1547.

Question 2

- 03** Explain why Henry VIII was unable to get his marriage to Catherine of Aragon annulled. **[12 marks]**
Target: AO1(a), AO1(b)

Levels Mark Scheme

- Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**
- L1:** Answers will contain either some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question or some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-2**
- L2:** Answers will demonstrate some knowledge and understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they will provide some explanations backed by evidence that is limited in range and/or depth. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **3-6**
- L3:** Answers will demonstrate good understanding of the demands of the question providing relevant explanations backed by appropriately selected information, although this may not be full or comprehensive. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **7-9**
- L4:** Answers will be well-focused, identifying a range of specific explanations, backed by precise evidence and demonstrating good understanding of the connections and links between events/issues. Answers will, for the most part, be well-written and organised. **10-12**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Answers should include a range of reasons as to why Henry VIII failed to achieve the annulment of his marriage.

Students might include some of the following factors:

- Catherine of Aragon appealed her case to Rome
- evidence given by Henry concerning the legitimacy of the marriage in relation to the consummation of the marriage between Catherine and Arthur was not convincing
- despite being Legatus a Latere, Wolsey could not act independently and declare the marriage invalid
- the Pope was the virtual prisoner of Charles V and could not act independently.

To reach higher levels, students will need to show the inter-relationship of the reasons given. For example, they might demonstrate:

- the main reason for the failure to achieve the annulment was the power of canon law and the ultimate authority of the Pope. Julius II had granted the dispensation for Catherine and Henry to marry in 1503 and this dispensation was valid. Before the Break with Rome, all subjects had the right to appeal their cases to Rome the ultimate Church court.

Question 2

- 04** 'The need to obtain an annulment was the most important reason for the Break with Rome.'
Explain why you agree or disagree with this view. **[24 marks]**

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

Levels Mark Scheme

- Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**
- L1:** Answers may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a limited part of the period of the question. Alternatively, there may be some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain some explicit comment with relevant but limited support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-11**
- L3:** Answers will show a developed understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, but they will lack depth and/or balance. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **12-16**
- L4:** Answers will show explicit understanding of the demands of the question. They will develop a balanced argument backed by a good range of appropriately selected evidence and a good understanding of historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, show organisation and good skills of written communication. **17-21**
- L5:** Answers will be well-focused and closely argued. The arguments will be supported by precisely selected evidence leading to a relevant conclusion/judgement, incorporating well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate. Answers will, for the most part, be carefully organised and fluently written, using appropriate vocabulary. **22-24**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Students should be able to make a judgement by balancing evidence, which supports the view given against that which does not.

Evidence which agree(s) might include:

- the original legislation, which reduced the power of the Pope, was intended to put pressure on the Pope to agree to the annulment. Reference should be made to the Submission of the Clergy and the Supplication of the Ordinaries
- the Act in Restraint of Appeals had, as its primary function, the prevention of Catherine's appeal to the Pope. The passing of this Act enabled the newly appointed Archbishop of Canterbury to grant the annulment
- the main reason for the annulment was to ensure a male heir and prevent Mary from inheriting the throne. The Act of Succession made this marriage invalid.

Evidence which disagree(s) might include:

- once the direction of legislation was organised by Thomas Cromwell there was a shift from the focus of the annulment to build on the wider powers achieved. The later acts consolidated Henry's power, broke with Rome and increased Henry's financial independence. Students should refer to the Act forbidding papal dispensation and the payment of Peter's Pence and the Act of Supremacy. These built on the earlier acts including the removal of Annates
- all the legislation had to be passed by Parliament and, although the passage of the Acts was not smooth, Parliament had its own reasons for agreeing to the transfer of power from Rome to England. These reasons were financial – less tax, power – more work for English courts, and religion – challenge to the authority of the Pope.

Good answers may conclude that a distinction needs to be made between the short and long-term reasons. In the short-term the annulment was the most important; in the long-term it was money, power and authority.

Question 3

05 Explain why monasteries were dissolved in the years 1536 to 1540. **[12 marks]**

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b)

Levels Mark Scheme

Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**

L1: Answers will contain either some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question or some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-2**

L2: Answers will demonstrate some knowledge and understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they will provide some explanations backed by evidence that is limited in range and/or depth. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **3-6**

L3: Answers will demonstrate good understanding of the demands of the question providing relevant explanations backed by appropriately selected information, although this may not be full or comprehensive. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **7-9**

L4: Answers will be well-focused, identifying a range of specific explanations, backed by precise evidence and demonstrating good understanding of the connections and links between events/issues. Answers will, for the most part, be well-written and organised. **10-12**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Students might include some of the following factors:

- the dissolution of monasteries in the 1530s was seen as a continuation of the policy begun by Cardinal Wolsey to provide funds to invest in education. Anne Boleyn certainly seems to have believed that this was the purpose of the dissolution, which began in 1536
- ostensibly, the monasteries were dissolved because of their moral and spiritual corruption. This applied especially to the smaller monasteries such as Maiden Bradley. The larger monasteries were morally and financially corrupt. In some cases, such as Glastonbury it was argued that they were also spiritually bankrupt
- the larger monasteries were dissolved because of their wealth and the lack of opposition to their closure, demonstrated by the willingness of the Abbots to hand over the monasteries
- the Catholic power base and potential papal loyalty were concerns to Henry and Cromwell. Although they had declared their loyalty to Henry they had mother houses in Europe
- parliament and the House of Lords, in particular, agreed because of the personal gain, which the dissolution made possible.

Do not reward anti-clericalism unless linked to specific monastic abuses.

To reach higher levels, students will need to show the inter-relationship of the reasons given. For example, they might argue that the public reason given was due to corruption. But all of those who supported the dissolution did so for personal gain.

Question 3

06 'The dissolution of the monasteries was the most important cause of the Pilgrimage of Grace.'

Explain why you agree or disagree with this view.

[24 marks]

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

Levels Mark Scheme

Nothing written worthy of credit.

0

L1: Answers may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a limited part of the period of the question. Alternatively, there may be some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**

L2: Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain some explicit comment with relevant but limited support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-11**

L3: Answers will show a developed understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, but they will lack depth and/or balance. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **12-16**

L4: Answers will show explicit understanding of the demands of the question. They will develop a balanced argument backed by a good range of appropriately selected evidence and a good understanding of historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, show organisation and good skills of written communication. **17-21**

L5: Answers will be well-focused and closely argued. The arguments will be supported by precisely selected evidence leading to a relevant conclusion/judgement, incorporating well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate. Answers will, for the most part, be carefully organised and fluently written, using appropriate vocabulary. **22-24**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Students should be able to make a judgement by balancing points which supports the view given against that which does not.

Points/factors/evidence which agree(s) might include:

- the Pilgrimage of Grace took place in 1536 following the dissolution of the smaller monasteries
- the restoration of the monasteries was a key demand of the Pontefract Articles
- monasteries in Lancashire played a key role in the organisation of the protest, e.g. Sawley Abbey. The abbot was punished for this involvement
- Robert Aske defended the importance of the northern abbeys in his deposition at his trial.

Points/factors/evidence which disagree(s) might include:

- the Lincolnshire Rebellion and protests in Yorkshire were more of a response to rumours about attacks on parish churches and the threat to religion in general
- the Pontefract Articles express concern about the break with Rome and the legitimacy of Mary. They express concern about the advice which Cromwell is giving to Henry
- there were significant social and economic concerns ranging from those which affected the peasantry, such as enclosure and high food prices, those which affected tenant farmers, such as entry fines and those which affected land-owners, such as the Statute of Uses.

Good answers are likely to/may conclude that the attack on the smaller monasteries was the starting point of the protest and, with the rumoured attack on parish churches was the point around which discontent could coalesce.

Converting marks into UMS marks

Convert raw marks into marks on the Uniform Mark Scale (UMS) by using the link below.

UMS conversion calculator: www.aqa.org.uk/umsconversion