

A-LEVEL HISTORY

Unit HIS3G: British State and People, 1865–1915

Mark scheme

June 2015

Version 1.0: Final Mark Scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Lead Assessment Writer and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation events which all associates participate in and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation process ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every associate understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for standardisation each associate analyses a number of students' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed and legislated for. If, after the standardisation process, associates encounter unusual answers which have not been raised they are required to refer these to the Lead Assessment Writer.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available from aqa.org.uk

Generic Introduction for A2

The A2 History specification is based on the assessment objectives laid down in QCA's GCE History subject criteria and published in the AQA specification booklet. These cover the skills, knowledge and understanding which are expected of A Level students. Most questions address more than one objective since a good historian must be able to combine a range of skills and knowledge. Consequently, the marking scheme which follows is a 'levels of response' scheme and assesses students' historical skills in the context of their knowledge and understanding of History.

The levels of response are a graduated recognition of how students have demonstrated their abilities in the Assessment Objectives. Students who predominantly address AO1(a) by writing narrative or description will perform at Level 1 or low Level 2 if some comment is included. Students who provide more explanation – (AO1(b), supported by the relevant selection of material, AO1(a)) – will perform at Level 2 or low Level 3 depending on their synoptic understanding and linkage of ideas. Students who provide explanation with evaluation, judgement and an awareness of historical interpretations will be addressing all 3 AOs (AO1(a); AO1(b); AO2(b)) and will have access to the higher mark ranges.

To obtain an award of Level 3 or higher, students will need to address the synoptic requirements of A Level. The open-ended essay questions set are, by nature, synoptic and encourage a range of argument. Differentiation between performance at Levels 3, 4, and 5 therefore depends on how a candidate's knowledge and understanding are combined and used to support an argument and the how that argument is communicated.

The mark scheme emphasises features which measure the extent to which a candidate has begun to *'think like a historian'* and show higher order skills. As indicated in the level criteria, students will show their historical understanding by:

- The way the requirements of the question are interpreted
- The quality of the arguments and the range/depth/type of material used in support
- The presentation of the answer (including the level of communication skills)
- The awareness and use of differing historical interpretations
- The degree of independent judgement and conceptual understanding shown

It is expected that A2 students will perform to the highest level possible for them and the requirements for Level 5, which demands the highest level of expertise have therefore been made deliberately challenging in order to identify the most able students.

CRITERIA FOR MARKING GCE HISTORY:**A2 EXAMINATION PAPERS****General Guidance for Examiners (to accompany Level Descriptors)**

Deciding on a level and the award of marks within a level

It is of vital importance that examiners familiarise themselves with the generic mark scheme and apply it consistently, as directed by the Principal Examiner, in order to facilitate comparability across options.

The indicative mark scheme for each paper is designed to illustrate some of the material that students might refer to (knowledge) and some of the approaches and ideas they might develop (skills). It is not, however, prescriptive and should only be used to exemplify the generic mark scheme.

When applying the generic mark scheme, examiners will constantly need to exercise judgement to decide which level fits an answer best. Few essays will display all the characteristics of a level, so deciding the most appropriate will always be the first task.

Each level has a range of marks and for an essay which has a strong correlation with the level descriptors the middle mark should be given. However, when an answer has some of the characteristics of the level above or below, or seems stronger or weaker on comparison with many other students' responses to the same question, the mark will need to be adjusted up or down.

When deciding on the mark within a level, the following criteria should be considered *in relation to the level descriptors*. Students should never be doubly penalised. If a candidate with poor communication skills has been placed in Level 2, he or she should not be moved to the bottom of the level on the basis of the poor quality of written communication. On the other hand, a candidate with similarly poor skills, whose work otherwise matched the criteria for Level 4 should be adjusted downwards within the level.

Criteria for deciding marks within a level:

- Depth and precision in the use of factual information
- Depth and originality in the development of an argument
- The extent of the synoptic links
- The quality of written communication (grammar, spelling, punctuation and legibility; an appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of ideas, including the use of specialist vocabulary)
- The way the answer is brought together in the conclusion

June 2015

A2 Unit 3: The State and the People: Change and Continuity

HIS3G: British State and People, 1865–1915

Question 1

- 01** To what extent was Gladstone able to pursue his principles of morality in his foreign policy in the years 1880 to 1885? **[45 marks]**

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

Generic Mark Scheme for essays at A2

Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**

- L1:** Answers will display a limited understanding of the demands of the question. They may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment but will make few, if any, synoptic links and will have limited accurate and relevant historical support. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be primarily descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain explicit comment but show limited relevant factual support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Historical debate may be described rather than used to illustrate an argument and any synoptic links will be undeveloped. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-15**
- L3:** Answers will show an understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, which may, however, lack depth. There will be some synoptic links made between the ideas, arguments and information included although these may not be highly developed. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will be clearly expressed and show reasonable organisation in the presentation of material. **16-25**
- L4:** Answers will show a good understanding of the demands of the question. They will be mostly analytical in approach and will show some ability to link ideas/arguments and information and offer some judgement. Answers will show an understanding of different ways of interpreting material and may refer to historical debate. Answers will be well-organised and display good skills of written communication. **26-37**
- L5:** Answers will show a very good understanding of the demands of the question. The ideas, arguments and information included will be wide-ranging, carefully chosen and closely interwoven to produce a sustained and convincing answer with a high level of synopticity. Conceptual depth, independent judgement and a mature historical understanding, informed

by a well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate, will be displayed. Answers will be well-structured and fluently written. **38-45**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Students will need to identify and evaluate whether Gladstone was able to pursue his principles of morality in foreign policy during his second ministry. Those principles were derived from his (High Anglican) Christian beliefs to do what was morally right. This included maintenance of peace and avoidance of war. Answers are not expected to make significant differentiation between foreign and imperial policies.

Students may refer to some of the following material in support of the view that Gladstone was able to pursue his moral principles in his foreign policy:

- he attempted to follow moral principles with preservation, or restoration, of peace at the centre of his foreign policy
- brief background reference may be made to Gladstone being largely successful in this regard during his first ministry and clear in his moral stand in condemning Disraeli's foreign policies, which he saw as immoral, during his time in opposition and especially emphasised in his Midlothian campaigns just before resuming office in 1880
- on doing so his intentions were to withdraw from Egypt and Afghanistan, and, it was believed by the Boers, to grant independence to the Transvaal
- he saw no British interests in the Sudan (nor in extending the empire or supporting the imperialists in Britain). He was influenced by his belief in peoples' freedom and self-government where possible. The debacle in the withdrawal from the Sudan was caused by the military commanders, notably Gordon, not the Prime Minister.

Nevertheless, there are a number of other factors to consider:

- given political, economic and military realities, Gladstone had to act from expediency rather than morality
- although he had condemned Disraeli's policies in Afghanistan and south Africa, in office he was prepared to use military force in inherited problems in the interests of Britain when necessary
- although Gladstone initially withdrew from Disraeli's government's level of involvement in Afghanistan, members of his own government insisted on intervention, especially by General Roberts, to protect India from the Russian threat and consequently British control over Afghanistan as a buffer state was restored by military force. Again, when there was a Russian incursion in March 1885, rather unexpectedly Gladstone began war preparations
- in opposition Gladstone had stated that the Transvaal would be restored to the Boers but in power he prevaricated and this led to the First Boer War with British defeat at Majuba Hill. The 1881 Convention of Pretoria was unclear in that the Transvaal was restored to the Boers but Britain had 'suzerainty', seemingly a compromise by Gladstone between morality and expediency
- with much confusion in Egypt Gladstone initiated strong military intervention (without the support of France) against Arabi Pasha leading to continued protection of the Suez Canal and firm British control of Egypt.

Furthermore, students may:

- argue that Gladstone was unable to pursue fully his principles of morality (unlike during his first ministry) because military interventions became necessary, either because of situations inherited from Disraeli's government, or because of his other consideration, the overriding interest of Britain
- contend that in the case of Afghanistan the overriding aim was to protect India, the 'jewel in the crown' of the British Empire. In the case of the Sudan there was a lack of clear British interests as well as a moral reason for withdrawal
- interpret Gladstone's policy intentions as being based on moral principles, but that circumstances led to inconsistency in their deployment in practice.

In conclusion, students may:

- argue that there was an attempt by Gladstone to pursue his principles of morality, but that circumstances often prevented this and in particular there was confusion, if not clear contrasts, between the pursuit of moral solutions and political realities, which led to military actions rather than the pursuit of peace at all costs.

Question 2

02 To what extent did the Labour movement achieve its aims in the years 1900 to 1915?

[45 marks]

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

Generic Mark Scheme for essays at A2

Nothing written worthy of credit.

0

L1: Answers will display a limited understanding of the demands of the question. They may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment but will make few, if any, synoptic links and will have limited accurate and relevant historical support. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**

L2: Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be primarily descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain explicit comment but show limited relevant factual support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Historical debate may be described rather than used to illustrate an argument and any synoptic links will be undeveloped. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-15**

L3: Answers will show an understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, which may, however, lack depth. There will be some synoptic links made between the ideas, arguments and information included although these may not be highly developed. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will be clearly expressed and show reasonable organisation in the presentation of material. **16-25**

L4: Answers will show a good understanding of the demands of the question. They will be mostly analytical in approach and will show some ability to link ideas/arguments and information and offer some judgement. Answers will show an understanding of different ways of interpreting material and may refer to historical debate. Answers will be well-organised and display good skills of written communication. **26-37**

L5: Answers will show a very good understanding of the demands of the question. The ideas, arguments and information included will be wide-ranging, carefully chosen and closely interwoven to produce a sustained and convincing answer with a high level of synopticity. Conceptual depth, independent judgement and a mature historical understanding, informed by a well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate, will be displayed. Answers will be well-structured and fluently written. **38-45**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Students will need to identify the aims of the Labour movement in the period and evaluate to what extent they were achieved, and balance this against other factors which inhibited their full achievement.

Students may refer to some of the following material in support of the view that the aims were achieved:

- a broad aim was to move Britain towards a fairer and more egalitarian society. Specific aims of trade unions were to improve wages and conditions of their members; and in politics to gain direct representation of working men (and women) on local bodies such as School Boards (until 1902) and Councils, but particularly in Parliament
- with organisation, including that of the Trades Union Congress (TUC), unions, eg for railway workers, other transport workers and dockers, using the strike weapon and socialist ideas, were relatively successful in the use of collective bargaining during the period
- there was success in 'Labour' and 'Lib-Lab' candidates being elected onto local bodies
- formation of the Labour Representation Committee (1900) with the joining together of the main socialist organisations, eg the Fabian Society (though not the Social Democratic Federation), the ILP, the TUC and some trade unions; and the work of Ramsay MacDonald. The LRC adopted the name of the Labour Party in 1906
- the election of 30 Labour MPs in the 1906 Election, 40 in January 1910 and 42 in December 1910 following co-operation through the Lib-Lab pact
- with the political parties having to take account of the interests of enfranchised working men, governments implemented legislation which improved working-class welfare and conditions. In particular Liberal governments, under some pressure from the Labour Party, brought in measures such as compensation for injuries at work, a shorter working day for miners, help in finding work through Labour Exchanges, unemployment benefit and minimum wages in the 'sweated trades'
- the Labour Party also helped to influence the Liberal introduction of old age pensions and reforms for children such as medical inspections, the Children's Charter (1908) and particularly the provision of school meals
- inclusion of Labour ministers (notably Henderson) in the 1915 Coalition government.

Nevertheless, there are a number of other factors to consider:

- there were significant setbacks for the unions over the Taff Vale Case (1900–1901) and the Osborne Judgement (1909)
- increasing militancy, partly under the influence of syndicalism in the years before 1914 and the formation of the 'Triple Alliance', brought only mixed success in terms of improved wages and conditions
- many in the working classes saw the Liberal Party as continuing to represent their interests during most of the period and the Tories also attracted significant numbers of working-class votes in the Elections of 1910
- the Labour Party had not succeeded in its support of votes for women (and all men) for Parliament by 1915
- Labour's inclusion in government in 1915 was due only to the needs of wartime politics.

Furthermore, students may:

- point out that the setbacks for the unions over the Taff Vale Case and the Osborne Judgement were overcome by the Liberal (and Labour-backed) legislation of the Trades Disputes Act (1906) and the Trade Union Act (1913)
- note that the Labour Party was likely to benefit from the payment of MPs from 1911.

In conclusion, students may:

- give a balanced view that despite setbacks, the trades unions' side of the Labour movement had improved the wages and conditions of many workers including the unskilled
- argue that the movement had seen considerable progress in gaining political influence and representation, though there was little prospect of Labour forming its own government in the period
- note that strong class divisions remained in British society and the Labour movement was fully wedded still in 1915 to represent essentially just the interests of the working classes
- understand that there had been some limited progress towards creating a fairer society but it was far from egalitarian in 1915.

Question 3

- 03** 'The political dominance of the Conservative Party in the years 1874 to 1905 was due to effective leadership.'
Assess the validity of this view. **[45 marks]**

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

Generic Mark Scheme for essays at A2

Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**

- L1:** Answers will display a limited understanding of the demands of the question. They may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment but will make few, if any, synoptic links and will have limited accurate and relevant historical support. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be primarily descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain explicit comment but show limited relevant factual support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Historical debate may be described rather than used to illustrate an argument and any synoptic links will be undeveloped. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-15**
- L3:** Answers will show an understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, which may, however, lack depth. There will be some synoptic links made between the ideas, arguments and information included although these may not be highly developed. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will be clearly expressed and show reasonable organisation in the presentation of material. **16-25**
- L4:** Answers will show a good understanding of the demands of the question. They will be mostly analytical in approach and will show some ability to link ideas/arguments and information and offer some judgement. Answers will show an understanding of different ways of interpreting material and may refer to historical debate. Answers will be well-organised and display good skills of written communication. **26-37**
- L5:** Answers will show a very good understanding of the demands of the question. The ideas, arguments and information included will be wide-ranging, carefully chosen and closely interwoven to produce a sustained and convincing answer with a high level of synopticity. Conceptual depth, independent judgement and a mature historical understanding, informed by a well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate, will be displayed. Answers will be well-structured and fluently written. **38-45**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Students will need, in this breadth question, to identify and explain the degree to which the Conservatives' success was due to effective leadership throughout the period. Effective leadership qualities included commanding political influence within the Conservative Party and in national politics, maintaining unity of the Party, success in elections, success in implementing and effectiveness of policies (domestic and foreign) and charisma. The leading politicians were Disraeli, Salisbury and Balfour, though consideration of Chamberlain is highly relevant and there may be references to others such as Randolph Churchill.

Students may refer to some of the following material in support of the view that the success of the Conservative Party was due to effective leadership:

- during most of the period the Conservative Party was successful due to effective leadership from Disraeli, Salisbury and Chamberlain, and also Balfour at least up to the point of his becoming Prime Minister
- Disraeli's success in the 1874 Election by focusing on giving the country a rest from the constant changes initiated by the 'exhausted volcanoes' (even though Cross soon went on to introduce extensive changes of his own)
- the qualities of Salisbury as Conservative Party leader and as Prime Minister for most of the period from 1885 to 1902 with his clear electoral victories in 1886, 1895 and the Khaki Election in 1900
- effective attacks of Randolph Churchill, especially over Home Rule, against the Liberals
- the charisma of Chamberlain, absorbed into what became the 'Conservative and Unionist' Party
- the popularity of policies pursued by the Conservative leaders: some social reforms; relatively effective policies in Ireland of Balfour and Salisbury (compared with the Home Rule solution attempted by Gladstone); imperialist and foreign policies implemented by Disraeli, Salisbury and Chamberlain
- Salisbury's largely successful electoral appeal (helped by the 1885 Redistribution Act) to middle-class 'Villa Tories'
- Conservative leaders maintained a largely united Party until 1903 (in contrast with the Liberals).

Nevertheless, there are a number of other factors to consider:

- in contrast with the Conservatives, leadership of the Liberals was relatively weak for much of the period. The Liberal Party produced only one outstanding leader, Gladstone, and it was undermined by his support of Home Rule after 1885 and the loss of Chamberlain, and later Bright
- in the 1874 Election the Liberal government's unpopular domestic and foreign policies were probably the major reason for Disraeli's victory rather than the performance of the Tory leader. The Liberals had managed to alienate almost every group which had supported them in 1868
- Disraeli showed weak judgement in not holding an Election in 1878 after his 'triumph' at the Congress of Berlin, but postponing it to 1880 when he lost mainly due to the effectiveness

of Gladstone's Midlothian campaigns and economic problems emerging during the 'Great Depression'

- a, if not the, major reason for Conservative success from 1886 onwards was the Liberal split over Home Rule: defection of the Liberal Unionists, Chamberlain (the obvious 'heir' to Gladstone as Liberal leader) and 'his' Radicals, and Hartington and the Whigs; ongoing unpopularity of the Liberals' Home Rule policy with the electorate, confirmed by their crushing Election defeat in 1895 following failure of the 1893 Bill
- though the Liberals suffered by being seen as a 'one issue party' they experienced also other divisions over imperial policy, emphasised during the Boer War; they were frequently disunited, eg between Radicals and Whigs, between pro- and anti-imperialists, and over the Boer War itself.

Furthermore, students may:

- note that a further reason for Conservative success was the (re)organisation of the Party by Gorst and then Middleton, changes encouraged by Disraeli and Salisbury
- emphasise the reversal of fortunes at the end of the period with the Liberals becoming reunited, under an increasingly confident leader, Campbell-Bannerman, in strong opposition to the policies of Balfour and Chamberlain: the 'Balfour' Education Act, the Licensing Act and above all Chamberlain's advocacy of tariff reform, a proposal which split the Conservatives with Balfour unable to commit himself to support it and resigning at the end of 1905 even before an election had been held
- note Balfour's refusal to act over the Taff Vale Judgement and 'Chinese Slavery' which strengthened the incipient Labour opposition.

In conclusion, students may:

- give a balanced view that there were multi-causal reasons for Conservative success over most (though not all) of the period, but that weaknesses of the opposition and in particular Liberal problems over Home Rule were as important, possibly more so, than the leadership of the Conservatives.

Converting marks into UMS marks

Convert raw marks into marks on the Uniform Mark Scale (UMS) by using the link below.

UMS conversion calculator: www.aqa.org.uk/umsconversion