



GCE MARK SCHEME

SUMMER 2019

HISTORY - UNIT 4  
DEPTH STUDY 1

THE MID TUDOR CRISIS IN WALES AND ENGLAND,  
c. 1529-1570

Part 2: Challenges Facing Mary and Elizabeth c.1553-1570

1100U10-1

## **INTRODUCTION**

This marking scheme was used by WJEC for the 2019 examination. It was finalised after detailed discussion at examiners' conferences by all the examiners involved in the assessment. The conference was held shortly after the paper was taken so that reference could be made to the full range of candidates' responses, with photocopied scripts forming the basis of discussion. The aim of the conference was to ensure that the marking scheme was interpreted and applied in the same way by all examiners.

It is hoped that this information will be of assistance to centres but it is recognised at the same time that, without the benefit of participation in the examiners' conference, teachers may have different views on certain matters of detail or interpretation.

WJEC regrets that it cannot enter into any discussion or correspondence about this marking scheme.

## UNIT 4

### DEPTH STUDY 1

#### THE MID TUDOR CRISIS IN WALES AND ENGLAND c.1529-1570

#### Part 2: CHALLENGES FACING MARY AND ELIZABETH c.1553-1570

### MARK SCHEME

#### QUESTION 1

#### Marking guidance for examiners

#### Summary of assessment objectives for Question 1

Question 1 assesses assessment objective 2. This assessment objective is focused on the ability to analyse and evaluate different ways in which aspects of the past have been interpreted. The total mark awarded to this question is 30.

#### The structure of the mark scheme

The mark scheme for Question 1 has two parts:

- Advice on each specific question outlining indicative content which can be used to assess the quality of the specific response. This content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material referred to. Assessors should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates.
- An assessment grid advising which bands and marks should be given to responses which demonstrate the qualities needed in assessment objective 2.

#### Deciding on the mark awarded within a band

The first stage for an examiner is to decide the overall band. The second stage is to decide how firmly the qualities expected for that band are displayed. Thirdly a final mark for the question can then be awarded.

## INDICATIVE CONTENT FOR QUESTION 1

*NOTE: This content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material referred to below. Assessors should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates. Each answer will be assessed on its merits according to the assessment grid as well as the indicative content.*

**With reference to the sources and your understanding of the historical context, assess the value of these three sources to an historian studying the challenges facing Elizabeth I in the period from 1558 to 1570.**

Candidates are expected to demonstrate their ability to analyse and evaluate a range of source material with a high degree of discrimination. Source evaluation skills should focus on discussing the strengths and the limitations of the nominated sources. To judge utility, there should be consideration of the content and the authorship of the nominated sources to discuss reliability, bias, purpose and validity, as appropriate. In analysing and evaluating the provided source material, candidates may deploy knowledge and understanding from their previous learning.

Credit may be given if previous learning is used to show understanding of the historical context if appropriate.

Candidates will consider the three sources in their historical context and might consider the value of the sources to an historian studying the challenges facing Elizabeth in the period from 1558 to 1570. Understanding of the historical context should be utilised to analyse and evaluate the strengths and limitations of the sources. Appropriate observations in the analysis and evaluation of the sources may include:

**Source A** This source is a pamphlet published abroad by an exiled Protestant cleric John Knox. Candidates should use their understanding of the historical context to identify this source as an aspect of the initial challenges facing Elizabeth on her accession in 1558. Scrutiny of the content of the source will show that Knox has serious concerns about a woman's ability to govern the kingdom effectively. In fact, he questions the very nature of female rule. The tone of the source is one of bitterness. He is clearly a strong opponent of the queen on gender grounds. He is a Scottish Protestant forced into exile from his adopted home of London by Mary Tudor. In this way, Source A is of considerable value to an historian studying the challenges facing Elizabeth as it shows that the idea of rule by a female was repugnant to many men. This source shows the difficulties facing any female ruler in a world dominated by men. Candidates may be aware that Knox did actually stress that his criticism was originally intended for Mary and not Elizabeth whose religious beliefs he shared and supported.

**Source B** This deals with the Puritan challenge facing Elizabeth as reported by a potentially hostile source—a Catholic agent of the Pope. Credit candidates that point out that Source B is an extract from a letter written by an anonymous agent living in London—might he have been a spy? Candidates should use their understanding of the historical context to identify this source as an aspect of the increasing challenges facing Elizabeth in terms of the potential for opposition by a growing Puritan sect with friends in high places at Court. This source is particularly valuable because it suggests that the political and religious situation in England was quite volatile in 1567.

Some of the men at court were as much a threat to Elizabeth as the Catholics they wished to war with because the queen risked being advised and manipulated by self-interested pro-Puritan parties. The author of Source B has no reason to lie, he is simply reporting on events as heard or seen by the unknown correspondent and published in an open not secret newsletter. It may be inaccurate but it gives the historian valuable evidence of the political and religious challenge facing Elizabeth.

**Source C** This offers a different perspective on the challenges facing Elizabeth by 1570. It is a legal document issued by the Pope—a public notice of intent to destroy a heretic queen. The specific historical context is that after nearly twelve years of patient persuasion to encourage Elizabeth and England back into the Catholic fold, the Pope has had enough. The outrageous incarceration of a Catholic queen—Mary, Queen of Scots—followed by the brutal suppression of the Northern rebels, has convinced the Pope that Elizabeth had and has no intention of returning to the Catholic faith. The reports in the regular reports received over the years has given the Pope sufficient evidence to take the most drastic step of all—public humiliation by excommunication. The Papal Bull is a call to arms and gives any true Catholic licence to assassinate the queen because it is God’s will which will secure the assassin an honoured place in heaven. This has the potential for war—with Spain and France—and rebellion by home-grown Catholic recusants. This is evidence of the ultimate challenge facing Elizabeth for it has the potential of removing her from the throne by force.

Overall, candidates will provide a judgment regarding the value of the sources to an historian studying the challenges facing Elizabeth in the period between 1558 and 1570 and are able to demonstrate that value through consideration of the tone and nature of the presented sources and understanding of the historical context.

**UNIT 4**  
**MARK SCHEME FOR QUESTION 1**

In general terms the responses will display characteristics of one of the six bands shown below.

The table below gives advice on which band, sub-band and marks should be awarded to answers showing the appropriate characteristics.

Candidates should be rewarded for making connections and comparisons between elements of both parts of the depth study, where relevant.

<b>Band 6 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>Sustained and accurate analysis and evaluation of the given sources; full understanding shown of the specific historical context associated with the set enquiry; reaches a full and substantiated judgement regarding the value of the sources to an historian studying the development of a particular issue over the period set.</i>
<b>ASE OVER THE PERIOD SET</b>		
<b>B6H</b>	<b>30</b>	The response shows accurate and sustained source evaluation using the content and attributions of each of the three sources, setting the response in the specific historical context and covering all of the period set in the enquiry. There will be a substantiated judgement regarding the value of the sources to an historian studying the development of a particular issue over the period set.
<b>B6S</b>	<b>27</b>	The response begins to show some characteristics of Band 6
<b>Band 5 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>Meaningful analysis and evaluation of the given sources involving valid evaluation of the content and attribution of the sources; understanding shown of the specific historical context associated with the set enquiry; reaches a valid judgement regarding the value of the sources to an historian studying a particular issue.</i>
<b>ASE</b>		
<b>B5H</b>	<b>25</b>	The response shows accurate source evaluation using the content and attributions of the three sources, setting the response in the specific historical context and covering most of the period set in the enquiry. There will be a valid and supported judgement on the value of all three sources to an historian studying a particular issue.
<b>B5S</b>	<b>23</b>	The response begins to show some characteristics of Band 5
<b>B5C</b>	<b>21</b>	This mark can be used if there is understanding shown of the specific historical context of one source only.
<b>Band 4 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>Clearly attempts an analysis and evaluation of the given sources in relation to the general historical context of the set enquiry with some evaluation of the content and attribution; a sound judgement is seen regarding the value of some or all three sources.</i>
<b>GCX, V and/or U</b>		
<b>B4H</b>	<b>20</b>	The response is able to discuss the strengths and limitations of the three sources by focusing on their attributions, content and especially the general historical context. This will be used to reach a reasoned judgement on value of all three sources. Occasional references to utility are acceptable.
<b>B4S</b>	<b>18</b>	The response is able to discuss the strengths and limitations of the three sources by focusing on their attributions, content and the general historical context. A judgement on value will be present on some or all of the three sources though some general comments on utility may be seen.
<b>B4C</b>	<b>16</b>	The response begins to show some characteristics of Band 4 in discussing the general historical context. Mainly focussed on UTILITY but with a limited reference to value.

<b>Band 3 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>Mechanistic and formulaic use of the content and attributions of the given sources to evaluate their utility and / or value; a limited judgement on the utility and / or value of the sources will be seen. Limited understanding of the historical context.</i>
<b>Mechanistic V, S&amp;L and U</b>		
<b>B3H</b>	<b>15</b>	
The response is able to evaluate the three sources by focusing on their attributions and content. Any reference to the historical context will be limited. There will be a mechanistic focus on evaluating the UTILITY and / or the VALUE of some or all of the sources. There will be a limited judgement on all of the sources.		
<b>B3S</b>	<b>13</b>	The response is able to evaluate some or all of the three sources by focusing on their attributions and / or content. Any reference to the historical context will be limited. There will be a limited judgement on some of the sources.
<b>B3C</b>	<b>11</b>	The response begins to show some characteristics of Band 3. This can also be used if only one source is attempted.
<b>Band 2 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>Mechanistic and formulaic use of the content and / or attributions of the given sources to show their strengths and / or limitations.</i>
<b>TRAWL</b>		
<b>B2H</b>	<b>8</b>	
The response is able to discuss the strengths and / or limitations of all three sources by focusing on their content and / or attributions.		
<b>B2S</b>	<b>6</b>	The response is able to discuss the strengths and / or limitations of some of the three sources by focusing on their content mostly.
<b>Band 1 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>Copies or paraphrases from content or attributions of the given sources.</i>
<b>COPYING / COMPREHENSION</b>		
<b>B1H</b>	<b>5</b>	
Paraphrases from all of the three sources and / or attributions or plain narrative.		
<b>B1S</b>	<b>3</b>	Copies from one or two of the three sources and/or attributions.
	<b>0</b>	Use for incorrect answers

## QUESTIONS 2 AND 3

### Marking guidance for examiners

#### Summary of assessment objectives for Question 2 and 3

Both questions assess assessment objective 1. This assessment objective is a single element focussed on the ability to analyse and evaluate and reach substantiated judgements. The mark awarded to the question chosen is 30.

#### The structure of the mark scheme

The mark scheme for Questions 2 and 3 has two parts:

- Advice on each specific question outlining indicative content which can be used to assess the quality of the specific response. This content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material referred to. Assessors should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates.
- An assessment grid advising which bands and marks should be given to responses which demonstrate the qualities needed in assessment objective 1.

#### Deciding on the mark awarded within a band

The first stage for an examiner is to decide the overall band. The second stage is to decide how firmly the qualities expected for that band are displayed. Thirdly a final mark for the question can then be awarded.

#### Organisation and communication

This issue should have a bearing if the standard of organisation and communication is inconsistent with the descriptor for the band in which the answer falls. In this situation, examiners may decide not to award the highest mark within the band.

## INDICATIVE CONTENT FOR QUESTION 2

*NOTE: This content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material referred to below. Assessors should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates. Each answer will be assessed on its merits according to the assessment grid as well as the indicative content.*

### **How far do you agree that Mary I's marriage with Philip of Spain was mainly responsible for the challenges she faced during her reign 1553-1558?**

Candidates are expected to consider and debate the full range of issues that affected the key concept in the question—in this case the extent to which Mary's marriage with Philip of Spain was mainly responsible for the challenges she faced during her reign (1553–1558). They will consider a range of key concepts such as causation, consequence, continuity, change and significance where appropriate and also the relationship between the key characteristics and features associated with the issue in the question. In addressing the context of the set question, candidates may deploy knowledge and understanding from their previous learning. Credit may be given if the knowledge and understanding deployed helps to address the specific question set.

Candidates will offer an analysis and evaluation of the extent to which Mary's marriage with Philip of Spain was mainly responsible for the challenges she faced during her reign (1553–1558). In order to reach a substantiated judgement about this issue, candidates may argue that the Spanish marriage was mainly responsible for the challenges facing Mary. Candidates may support the proposition by considering:

- Mary's weak personality and deference to her husband Philip, which undermined royal authority;
- religious grievances stemming from the persecution of Protestants inspired by imported Spanish clerics;
- the Wyatt rebellion, which was partly inspired by anti-Spanish bias;
- the influence of Spanish advisers, such as Renard, and English entanglement in Spanish foreign policy.

Candidates may consider challenging the proposition in the question by arguing that the Spanish marriage was but one of a number of challenges facing Mary during her reign. They may consider:

- the tension due to prevailing attitudes to the gender of the monarch, for example pamphlets by Becon and Knox;
- opposition from the Protestant exiles and rivalry between royal advisers at court, for example Paget and Gardiner;
- the weak financial position of the monarchy due to economic problems such as the national debt, high inflation and debasement of the coinage;
- the economic depression that led to a rise in poverty and vagrancy, which in turn led to higher crime rates;
- sympathy for Protestant martyrs encouraged a wave of revulsion and hostility.

Overall candidates will offer a debate and come to a substantiated judgement regarding the extent to which Mary's marriage with Philip of Spain was mainly responsible for the challenges she faced during her reign (1553–1558).

### INDICATIVE CONTENT FOR QUESTION 3

*NOTE: This content is not prescriptive and candidates are not expected to mention all the material referred to below. Assessors should seek to credit any further admissible evidence offered by candidates. Each answer will be assessed on its merits according to the assessment grid as well as the indicative content.*

### **To what extent was the growth of towns the main development in the society and economy of Wales and England in the period from 1553 to 1570?**

Candidates are expected to consider and debate the full range of issues that affected the key concept in the question—in this case whether the growth of towns was the main development in the society and economy of Wales and England in the period from 1553 to 1570. They will consider a range of key concepts such as causation, consequence, continuity, change and significance where appropriate and also the relationship between the key characteristics and features associated with the issue in the question. In addressing the context of the set question, candidates may deploy knowledge and understanding from their previous learning. Credit may be given if the knowledge and understanding deployed helps to address the specific question set.

Candidates will offer an analysis and evaluation of whether the growth of towns was the main development in the society and economy of Wales and England in the period from 1553 to 1570. In order to reach a substantiated judgement about this issue, candidates may argue that the growth of towns was the main development in the society and economy of Wales and England. They may support the proposition by considering:

- the growth of towns, which led to an increase in trade and wealth creation;
- towns led to better road links hence the Highways Act of 1555 ;
- demographic shift, for example rural depopulation and urban expansion;
- social and political advancement, for example the rise of a middle class of merchants and artisans with greater influence and power especially in parliament.

Candidates might consider challenging the proposition in the question by arguing that the growth of towns was but one of a number of other equally significant developments in the society and economy of Wales and England between 1553 and 1570. They may consider:

- economic developments, such as rising inflation. Increases in food prices led to starvation and food riots were significant indicators of change during this period.
- social and economic factors, such as the creation of landed estates adding to the wealth of rising gentry and merchants;
- widespread estate consolidation and enclosure;
- changes in the agricultural industry, which moved from arable to pastoral farming;
- rising unemployment due to changes in agricultural industry, which in turn led to rising levels of poverty and vagrancy;
- religious developments, which were of major significance during a period that saw three changes in the state religion and the development of religious non-conformity.

Overall candidates will offer a debate and come to a substantiated judgement regarding the growth of towns and whether this was the main development in the society and economy of Wales and England between 1553 and 1570.

## UNIT 4

### MARK SCHEME QUESTIONS 2 AND 3

In general terms the responses will display characteristics of one of the six bands shown below.

The table below gives advice on which band, sub-band and marks should be awarded to answers showing the appropriate characteristics.

Candidates should be rewarded for making connections and comparisons between elements of both parts of the depth study, where relevant.

<b>Band 6 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>The response is fully focused on the exact key concept in the set question, covering the whole of set period, with a clear and convincing debate on the main developments and reaching a substantiated judgement in a lucid and fully coherent essay.</i>
<b>B6H</b>	<b>30</b>	The response engages with the exact key concept and the fuller range of issues arising from the question set throughout the essay and is able to provide an analytical, evaluative and lucid essay with a fully convincing and substantiated judgement covering the whole of the set period.
<b>B6S</b>	<b>27</b>	The response engages with the key concept and the fuller range of issues arising from the question set throughout the essay and is able to provide an analytical, evaluative and coherent essay with a convincing and substantiated judgement covering nearly all of the set period.
<b>Band 5 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>The response is mainly focused on debating the key concept in the set question, covering most or all of the full period. The response considers most of the main developments; provides a convincing debate and is able to come to a supported, balanced and appropriate judgement.</i>
<b>B5H</b>	<b>25</b>	The response engages with the key concept and offers a convincing debate regarding the range of issues arising from the question set throughout most of the essay. The essay will be analytical, evaluative and well written with a balanced and appropriate judgement covering most or all of the set period.
<b>B5S</b>	<b>23</b>	The response has a focus on debating the key concept set throughout most of the essay and is able to provide an analytical, evaluative and well written essay with a balanced and appropriate judgement covering some or most of the set period.
<b>B5C</b>	<b>21</b>	The response begins to show some of the characteristics of Band 5. <i>[This can be used for good conceptual responses which do not cover the greater part of the period]</i>

<b>Band 4 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>The response has some focus on the key concept in the set question covering some to all of the set period, with some debate on some of the developments and a supported, balanced judgement on the key concept in a structured essay. There may well be some drift but there should be the beginning of a meaningful debate in the response.</i>
<b>B4H</b>	<b>20</b>	The response will feature some meaningful discussion of how and why the main developments, events or factors had an impact on the key concept in the set question over some or most of the period set. There will be an attempt at a balanced and supported judgement though some slight drift may be apparent.
<b>B4S</b>	<b>18</b>	The response begins to discuss the key concept in the question set, often with a series of mini judgements. There may be an attempt to consider a series of developments, events or factors in relation to the key concept set over some or most of the period. There may well be some listing of developments and some drift.
<b>Band 3 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>The response has some focus on the key issues set and begins to discuss these to come to a judgement on the question set. The response is usually restricted to a “for and against” discussion with some evidence of listing and unloading of notes. There may well be some considerable drift; and there may well be a mechanistic tone to the response.</i>
<b>B3H</b>	<b>15</b>	The response is based on a series of assertions, developments or factors over the period rather than the key concept in the question set. The response does offer a limited but valid judgement.
<b>B3S</b>	<b>13</b>	The response tends to be in the form of a generalised, listing of developments and factors.
<b>B4C</b>	<b>16</b>	The response begins to show some characteristics of Band 4.  <i>[This can be used for good Band 3 responses that offer at least one valid reference or judgement on the key concept.]</i>
<b>Band 2 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>The response is largely based on the TOPIC area and is descriptive.</i>
<b>B2H</b>	<b>8</b>	The response is a predominantly descriptive account of the topic. There will be a “tagged on” judgement.
<b>B2S</b>	<b>6</b>	The response is a descriptive account of the developments and factors related to the topic area with no judgement attempted.
<b>Band 1 CHARACTERISTICS</b>		<i>The response is very limited, undeveloped, very brief or largely irrelevant.</i>
<b>B1H</b>	<b>5</b>	The response is very limited and undeveloped though there is some weak link to the topic area.
<b>B1S</b>	<b>3</b>	The response is very brief and / or largely irrelevant to the concept set.
	<b>0</b>	Use for incorrect answers